

Winter 2002

A Year in the Life of Death: Murders and Capital Sentences in South Carolina

David Elton McCord
Drake University School of Law

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/sclr>



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

McCord, David Elton (2002) "A Year in the Life of Death: Murders and Capital Sentences in South Carolina," *South Carolina Law Review*. Vol. 53 : Iss. 2 , Article 5.

Available at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/sclr/vol53/iss2/5>

This Article is brought to you by the Law Reviews and Journals at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in South Carolina Law Review by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact dillarda@mailbox.sc.edu.

A YEAR IN THE LIFE OF DEATH: MURDERS AND CAPITAL SENTENCES IN SOUTH CAROLINA, 1998

DAVID MCCORD*

I. INTRODUCTION	250
II. THE DATA FROM SLED	252
A. <i>Why 1998? Why South Carolina?</i>	252
B. <i>What the SLED Report Data Showed</i>	254
1. <i>Population Effects</i>	254
2. <i>By Geography</i>	256
3. <i>By Income</i>	256
4. <i>By Month</i>	257
5. <i>Days of the Week</i>	258
6. <i>Time of Day</i>	258
7. <i>Victim Resident Status</i>	258
8. <i>Weapon Type</i>	259
9. <i>Circumstances</i>	259
10. <i>Relationship of Offender and Victim</i>	260
11. <i>Premises of Murder</i>	261
12. <i>Race/Gender/Age</i>	262
13. <i>Victims</i>	264
14. <i>Alcohol/Drug Use</i>	265
15. <i>Active/Cleared</i>	266
16. <i>Other Crimes</i>	266
C. <i>Correlation Between the Race and Gender of Suspects and Victims</i>	267
III. AN ANALYSIS BASED ON INFORMATION FROM NEWSPAPERS	269
A. <i>The Case Sample and the Process of Assembling It</i>	269
B. <i>Categories of Homicides</i>	271
C. <i>General Observations Regarding Newsworthiness</i>	272
D. <i>Summaries of Categories and Newsworthiness Therein</i>	274
1. <i>Domestic—Male/Female Relationship—Spontaneous</i>	274

* Associate Dean and Professor of Law, Drake Law School; J.D. Harvard Law School 1978. The author would like to thank his secretary, Karla Westberg, and his research assistants—Leslie Clemenson, Bethany Currie, Travase Erickson, Michael Marquess, and Christine Sand—for their diligent assistance. Also, thanks go to Lt. Jerry Hamby of the South Carolina Law Enforcement Division for providing essential information without which this Article could not have been written.

2. Domestic Male/Female Relationship— Planned: Stalking, Luring, etc.	275
3. Domestic Male/Female Relationship— Planned: Conspiracy	275
4. Domestic Male/Female Relationship— Murder/Suicide	276
5. Domestic Male/Female Relationships: Collateral Victim	276
6. Domestic—Child Victim	277
7. Domestic—Other Relationships	278
8. Acquaintance Disputes	278
9. Stranger Disputes—Arising in a Bar/Nightclub	279
10. Stranger Disputes—Others	279
11. Drug Disputes	279
12. During Another Felony	280
13. Insufficient Information to Categorize	281
IV. CAPITAL SENTENCES	282
A. Introduction	282
B. The Worst Cases	282
1. The Worst Homicides	285
a. Nine (or Possibly More) Depravity Points	285
b. Eight Depravity Points	286
c. Six Depravity Points	287
d. Five Depravity Points	288
e. Four Depravity Points	288
f. Three Depravity Points	291
C. Overinclusion Examined	294
D. Underinclusion Examined	294
E. Did Race-of-Defendant Discrimination Exist?	295
F. Victim Race Effects	296
V. CONCLUSION	297
APPENDICES	299

I. INTRODUCTION

About a decade ago, *Baltimore Sun* reporter David Simon spent a year with the Baltimore homicide unit. He wrote a fascinating book based upon his experiences, entitled *Homicide: A Year on the Killing Streets*.¹ But Simon's book, while illuminating and engrossing, did not present an empirically exhaustive survey of all the homicides in Baltimore for that year. Rather,

1. DAVID SIMON, *HOMICIDE: A YEAR ON THE KILLING STREETS* (1991).

Simon gave an overview and focused on particular cases being worked by the squad of detectives with whom he had affiliated himself.²

Inspired by Simon's idea, I undertook a study covering the same one-year time frame, but inclusive of all homicides and more expansive in geographic scope—a state rather than a city.³ In as much detail as possible, it became my goal to describe all of the murders and nonnegligent manslaughters⁴ in one state for one year. As a part of that effort, I wanted to analyze the death sentences resulting from those crimes to assess whether those sentences were only imposed in the most heinous cases (as death penalty supporters claim) or whether they were imposed in a seemingly arbitrary or racially discriminatory manner (as death penalty detractors often argue).

This Article consists of three parts. In Part II, I explain why I chose South Carolina and the year 1998 for my study. Then I set forth the findings I extracted from records kept by the South Carolina State Law Enforcement Division (SLED) concerning the murders and nonnegligent manslaughters (hereinafter simply "homicides") in South Carolina for that year. Further, I analyze the data using population, income, and race data from census figures⁵ in order to discover patterns.

The SLED data is in the form of a computer printout with one line devoted to each homicide.⁶ Thus, Part III augments the raw data from Part II with additional information gleaned from newspaper reports about the homicides. I exhaustively researched the South Carolina newspapers available on-line and found details concerning over half of the cases. These news reports revealed interesting patterns concerning both the homicides themselves and the reporting of them.

2. See *id.* at 595 (discussing Simon's stint as a "police intern" with the Baltimore Police Department's homicide unit).

3. While the scope of my study is broader and more exhaustive, I do not pretend to believe that my work will in any way rival Simon's on a stylistic basis.

4. For purposes of brevity in the title of the Article, I used the term "murders" rather than the more exact term "murder and nonnegligent manslaughter" that I obtained information about in the *Sourcebook of Criminal Justice Statistics*. SOURCEBOOK OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE STATISTICS 1999 (Ann L. Pastore et al. eds., 27th ed. 2000) [hereinafter SOURCEBOOK]. "Nonnegligent manslaughter" is meant to encompass what under the common law would be called "heat of passion" manslaughter, as well as "reckless homicide." *Id.* at 616 (defining non-negligent manslaughter as "intentionally and without legal jurisdiction causing the death of another when action under extreme provocation").

5. All figures come from the 2000 Census, except for the income figures, which are based on 1997 data. See U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, CENSUS 2000 (2001), at <http://www.census.gov> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002) [hereinafter CENSUS 2000]; U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, CENSUS 1997 (rev. 2000), at http://www.census.gov/hhes/www/saipa/stcty/c97_45.htm (last visited Jan. 23, 2002) [hereinafter CENSUS 1997].

6. South Carolina Law Enforcement Division, Homicide Data in South Carolina 1998 (Nov. 1, 2000) (unpublished report, on file with author) [hereinafter SLED Report]. A revised, published report is also available. See UNIF. CRIME REPORTS DEP'T, STATE LAW ENFORCEMENT DIV., CRIME IN SOUTH CAROLINA (1999) [hereinafter CRIME IN SOUTH CAROLINA]. The calculations in this Article are based on the SLED Report.

Finally, in Part IV, I examine the data from the perspective of the death penalty. I analyze whether the defendants who were sentenced to death for homicides committed in South Carolina during 1998 were (a) all of the most heinous murderers, (b) some of the most heinous murderers, or (c) an arbitrarily selected group that included less heinous murderers. Further, I examine the data to see whether any patterns of racial disparity are observable.

II. THE DATA FROM SLED

A. *Why 1998? Why South Carolina?*

I began my search for a suitable jurisdiction in which to conduct my study by referring to the *Sourcebook of Criminal Justice Statistics* that is published on a yearly basis by the United States Department of Justice.⁷ The answer to the question “Why 1998?” is straightforward: the 1998 *Sourcebook* figures were the most current figures available when I began this research project in the fall of 2000. However, the answer to the question “Why South Carolina?” is more complicated.

I wanted a state that met three criteria: (1) a state that had a sizeable number of homicides, but still a small enough number that I could research each one of them—I figured this to be around 200; (2) a state that had the death penalty; and (3) a state that was serious about using the death penalty as demonstrated by the fact that it regularly executed malefactors. Based on these three criteria, the likely candidates seemed to be Arkansas (201 murders⁸ and twenty-three executions as of December 31, 2000⁹) and Oklahoma (204 murders¹⁰ and thirty executions as of same date¹¹).

I decided to check on the information available in Oklahoma first. I was surprised to learn from a knowledgeable official within the Oklahoma Department of Justice¹² that very few states have any detailed, collated information on any crimes beyond basic raw numbers of each type of crime committed. For homicides, Oklahoma could provide only a printout that listed three items: (1) the county of occurrence, (2) the means of causing death, and (3) the date.¹³ However, the Oklahoma official did tell me that South Carolina would be the best bet because that state had received a significant grant from the federal government some years back to develop an “incident-based

7. SOURCEBOOK, *supra* note 4. Current versions are available at <http://www.albany.edu/sourcebook/> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

8. *Id.* at 279.

9. DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., NUMBER OF EXECUTIONS BY STATE SINCE 1976, *at* <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/dpicreg.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

10. SOURCEBOOK, *supra* note 4, at 279.

11. DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9.

12. Telephone Interview with Rodney Eaton, Field Services Supervisor, Oklahoma State Bureau of Investigation (Sept. 7, 2000).

13. *Id.*

reporting system,” instead of a “summary reporting system” that prevails in virtually every other state.¹⁴ South Carolina certainly met two of my criteria—it had the death penalty and was serious about using it (twenty-five executions as of December 31, 2000¹⁵). But the number of homicides listed for South Carolina (306) was more than I had initially bargained for.¹⁶ However, I decided that if I could get the appropriate information from South Carolina, I was willing to do the additional work necessary to deal with the larger number of homicides.

Unfortunately for South Carolina, it is a good state by which to study homicides. The homicide rate in South Carolina for 1998 was calculated as 8.0 per 100,000 population, which makes it one of the most murderous states in the country—only Alabama (8.1), Arizona (8.1), Georgia (8.1), Illinois (8.4), Louisiana (12.8), Maryland (10.0), Mississippi (11.4), Nevada (9.7), New Mexico (10.9), North Carolina (8.1), and Tennessee (8.5) exceeded South Carolina’s rate for 1998, and most of them not by a significant margin.¹⁷ I made my own calculation of the South Carolina homicide rate, based on the 2000 Census data and arrived at the figure 7.6.¹⁸ I assume the discrepancy between this figure and the 8.0 in the *Sourcebook* can be explained by the *Sourcebook*’s use of an earlier census figure. I will use the 7.6 figure for purposes of this Article.

My efforts to obtain data from South Carolina were fruitful. SLED was quite helpful by providing me a printout of the available information concerning the 305 homicides in South Carolina during 1998.¹⁹ I have been unable to account for the discrepancy between the *Sourcebook* number of 306, and the printout version of 305 homicides. While the SLED Report did not provide the names of the victims and alleged perpetrators, which would have been very helpful in performing news database searches, it did contain a lot of useful information, particularly when compared with what is available in most other states.²⁰

14. *Id.*

15. DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9.

16. SOURCEBOOK, *supra* note 4, at 279.

17. *Id.*

18. *Id.* at 279; CENSUS 2000, *supra* note 5. Calculations are based on the census population as reported on April 1, 2000.

19. See SLED Report, *supra* note 6. SLED collects the data from local police agencies—city police departments and county sheriffs’ offices. The local agency sends SLED copies of its “incident reports”—summaries written by the investigating officers shortly after the “incident.” In the case of a homicide, the “incident” is the homicide.

The local agency transmits the incident report, either through pre-coded data or a paper copy, to SLED during the course of the year. SLED transmits back monthly summaries, and a year-end summary to each local agency in an effort to make sure that all incidents are reported, and that the reports are updated with new developments. As to homicides, which are less numerous than many of the other types of incidents about which data is collected, SLED takes a particularly active role in prompting the local agencies to update the information. Telephone Interview with Jerry Hamby, Lieutenant, South Carolina Law Enforcement Division (July 26, 2001).

20. See SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

The SLED report provided the following information: (1) the county of the occurrence; (2) the date of the homicide; (3) the time of the homicide; (4) the day of the week of the homicide; (5) the weapon used; (6) a one-word description of the location; (7) the race, gender, and age of the victim; (8) a one-word description of the relationship between the victim and the offender; (9) the race, gender, and age of the offender as reported to the police; (10) the race, gender, and age of any offender actually arrested; (11) a one-word description of the circumstances of the homicide; (12) whether there was evidence of alcohol or drug use by the victim or the offender; (13) whether the offender committed additional offenses in the course of the homicide; and (14) the status of the case (either "Arrest," "Active" or "[offender] Dead").²¹

The law provides for a presumption of innocence. In this Article, though, I will indulge in a presumption of guilt. That is, I will assume that a person arrested for a homicide is guilty of it, and if no arrest has been made, then I will assume that the description listed in the SLED Report is correct as to the race, gender, and age of the offender. For my purposes, the "offender" listed in the SLED Report is the actual offender. I see no other way to make the data meaningful, inasmuch as I was able to determine the actual outcomes of a relatively small percentage of the cases (and even an actual outcome could be erroneous).

There are two reasons that this presumption of guilt largely comports with reality. First, many of the homicides are committed in a domestic context or between acquaintances, and there is usually no doubt about the identity of the offender. Second, of the outcomes I was able to ascertain, the person arrested was acquitted in only two cases²²—both times on the basis of self defense, not on the basis that the police arrested the wrong person. In essence, unlike the fictional world of murder mysteries, the real world of homicides does not involve many "whodunits," but a whole host of "whydunits."

B. What the SLED Report Data Showed

1. Population Effects

byI have listed the forty-six counties in South Carolina in decreasing order of population, and have calculated the homicide rate for each (per 100,000 residents).²³ Interestingly, the figures do not support the generally-held belief that urban areas are hotbeds of homicidal activity.²⁴ According to the 2000 Census, South Carolina has three metropolitan areas in the top 200 in population size in the United States: Greenville-Spartanburg-Anderson

21. *Id.* A status of "Active" means that no arrest had been made as of one year following the close of calendar year 1998.

22. See *infra* Appendix G at no.11; Appendix N at no.1.

23. See *infra* Appendix A.

24. See *infra* Appendix A.

(962,441, rank 52), with homicide rates in these counties of 6.3, 9.8, and 6.0, respectively; Charleston-North Charleston (549,033, rank 77), with homicide rates in Charleston and Berkeley Counties of 5.2 and 4.9, respectively; and Columbia (536,691, rank 80), in Lexington and Richland Counties, with homicide rates of 4.6 and 8.4, respectively.²⁵ In five of these seven counties, the homicide rates were less than that of the state as a whole (7.6),²⁶ and in the other two counties (Spartanburg, 9.9; and Richland, 8.4) the rate did not dramatically exceed the state rate.²⁷

To take into account the possibility that these figures could be deceptive because of disparities in the land areas of the counties, Appendix B lists the counties in order of decreasing population density with the accompanying homicide rates.²⁸ Again, the most densely populated counties usually had homicide rates below the state rate.²⁹ Specifically, of the ten most densely populated counties, only two of them (Spartanburg (9.9) and Richland (8.4)) had homicide rates that exceeded the state rate.³⁰

On the other hand, counties with the most homicides tended to be among those with comparatively small total populations and population densities.³¹ Appendix A shows that ten of the eleven counties with double-digit homicide rates were in the lowest half of counties in terms of total population (with the lone exception of Orangeburg County, 16th in population rank).³² And the three counties with homicide rates over 20.0 were all in the lowest third in total population.³³ The population density figures in Appendix B tell the same tale: all the counties with double-digit homicide rates were in the lowest sixty percent in population density.³⁴

There is a small counter-trend evident: the three counties with no homicides had small populations and sparse population densities.³⁵ Further, many counties have such small populations that even one homicide has a dramatic effect on the rate; for example, compare Barnwell (23,500, no homicides, 0.0 rate) with Fairfield (23,500, one homicide, 4.3 rate) and Hampton (21,400, two homicides, 9.3 rate).³⁶ Thus, some of the small counties may be statistical flukes in the sense that their rarely-occurring homicides happened to have been committed in the year I chose to study. However, the prevalence of high homicide rates in small counties shows that the overall trend

25. See CENSUS 2000, *supra* note 5, at <http://www.census.gov/population/cen2000/phc-t3/tab03.pdf> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

26. See *supra* note 18 and accompanying text.

27. See *infra* Appendix A.

28. See *infra* Appendix B.

29. See *infra* Appendix B.

30. See *infra* Appendices A-B.

31. See *infra* Appendices A-B.

32. See *infra* Appendix A.

33. See *infra* Appendix A.

34. See *infra* Appendix B.

35. See *infra* Appendices A-B.

36. See *infra* Appendix A.

is not a fluke.³⁷ Contrary to popular perception, rural areas in South Carolina are more homicide-prone than urban areas.³⁸

2. *By Geography*

I wanted to examine whether particular geographic areas of South Carolina were homicide-prone or not. Appendix C inscribes the county homicide rates on a map of the state.³⁹ The distribution of homicide rates seems random, with two exceptions. First, a four-county region in the northeastern part of the state, bordering on or close to North Carolina was a particularly homicidal area in 1998; Marlboro and Dillon Counties had the two highest rates in the state, and Chesterfield and Marion Counties were fourth and fifth, respectively.⁴⁰ The second exception was that all three counties with no homicides were close together along the Georgia border.⁴¹

3. *By Income*

There is a popular conception that crime in general, and homicide in particular, is correlated with poverty.⁴² To determine whether this was true in South Carolina during 1998, I compiled two appendices that combine the homicide data with census data regarding income levels.⁴³

Appendix D ranks the counties in order of decreasing median household income based on 1997 data with the corresponding homicide rates.⁴⁴ The correlation of income with homicide rate is clear.⁴⁵ Out of the ten top counties in median income, only three of them had homicide rates that exceeded the

37. *See infra* Appendices A-B.

38. *See infra* Appendices A-B.

39. *See infra* Appendix C.

40. *See infra* Appendices A-C.

41. *See infra* Appendices A-C.

42. *See, e.g.,* WALTER S. DEKESEREDY & MARTIN D. SCHWARTZ, *CONTEMPORARY CRIMINOLOGY* 312-14 (1996) (determining what accounts for the strong relationship between both racial and economic inequalities and homicide). This undergraduate criminology text summarizes a well-known theory of Judith and Peter Blau as follows:

They argue that “sheer poverty” or the absence of material goods (cars, houses, color TVs, and so on) does not motivate poor people to kill others. Rather, homicide is the product of *relative deprivation*. In other words, disenfranchised people commit homicide because they harbor deep feelings of despair, frustration, hopelessness, resentment, and alienation generated by inequalities that they define as unjust.

Id. at 312 (emphasis in original). The Blaus’ original work can be found at Judith R. Blau & Peter M. Blau, *The Cost of Inequality: Metropolitan Structure and Violent Crime*, 47 AM. SOC. REV. 114 (1982).

43. *See infra* Appendices D-E.

44. *See infra* Appendix D.

45. *See infra* Appendix D.

state rate, but not by much.⁴⁶ On the other hand, all of the counties with homicide rates over 15.0 were in the bottom half of counties in median income, and all three counties with rates over 20.0 were in the bottom ten in terms of median income.⁴⁷

Unsurprisingly, Appendix E, which correlates the poverty rates in each county based on 1997 data with the homicide rates, clearly shows the same pattern: the five counties with the highest homicide rates were among the top eleven in poverty rates.⁴⁸ At the other end of the spectrum, of the ten counties with the lowest poverty rates, only one of them had a homicide rate above the state rate, but not by much.⁴⁹

4. *By Month*

The homicides by month are as follows:

January	36
February	25
March	22
April	20
May	20
June	25
July	19
August	28
September	35
October	25
November	26
December	26 ⁵⁰

The spread is relatively even among the months. The only modestly discernible pattern is that the homicides are the fewest in the months of spring (March, April, and May with a total of sixty-two), the next fewest in the summer months (June, July, and August with a total of seventy-two), and the most numerous in the fall months (September, October, and November with a total of eighty-six) and winter months (December, January, and February with a total of eighty-seven).⁵¹

46. See *infra* Appendix D.

47. See *infra* Appendix D.

48. See *infra* Appendix E.

49. See *infra* Appendix E.

50. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

51. *Id.*

5. *Days of the Week*

The homicides were evenly distributed among days of the week, with Friday and Saturday being somewhat higher: Sunday – forty-two, Monday – forty-two, Tuesday – thirty-eight, Wednesday – thirty-nine, Thursday – thirty-six, Friday – forty-nine, and Saturday – fifty-nine.⁵²

6. *Time of Day*

The homicides were reported for each hour of the day.⁵³ From 4:00 a.m. to noon was the low period for homicides—ranging from a low of three during the 8:00-9:00 a.m. hour to a high of nine during the 6:00-7:00 a.m. hour.⁵⁴ Homicide activity picked up between 1:00 p.m. and 6:00 p.m.—a high of twelve during the 4:00-5:00 p.m. hour and a low of eight during the 3:00-4:00 p.m. hour.⁵⁵ The peak period for homicides was between 7:00 p.m. and 3:00 a.m.—ranging from a high of twenty-six during the 11:00 p.m. to midnight hour and a low of thirteen during the midnight to 1:00 a.m. hour.⁵⁶

7. *Victim Resident Status*

Most victims were killed very close to home. Two hundred and seventy-two victims were killed in the same jurisdiction (the city or county of the reporting police agency) they lived.⁵⁷ Twenty other victims were South Carolina residents, but were killed in another police jurisdiction in the state.⁵⁸ Only four victims were from out-of-state.⁵⁹ Nine victims were of unknown residence.⁶⁰

52. *Id.*

53. *Id.*

54. *Id.*

55. *Id.*

56. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

57. *Id.*

58. *Id.*

59. *Id.*

60. *Id.*

8. *Weapon Type*

The list of weapons used, beginning with the most-used weapon and continuing through the least-used are as follows:

Handgun	158
Knives/cutting instrument	48
Personal weapons	30
Shotgun	25
Blunt object	19
Rifle	10
Firearm, unknown type	10
Strangulation/hanging	7
Fire/incendiary device	6
Motor vehicle	3
Other	3
Drug/narcotic/sleeping pills	1
Drowning	1 ⁶¹

Firearms homicides, totaling 203, outnumbered all other weapons combined.⁶²

9. *Circumstances*

These figures are a result of rough and ready, one-phrase law enforcement categorization of the homicides.⁶³ Thus, while the categorization may be incorrect in any given case, the figures in aggregate give a good general idea of the broad categories into which homicides fall. I will list them in the order of most occurring to least occurring.

Argument	127
Other felony involved	72
Lover's quarrel	44
Drug dealing	29
Other circumstances	29
Assault on law enforcement officer	1 ⁶⁴

61. *Id.* Four of the deaths were listed as being from unknown causes. *Id.* There were also four categories of weapon-type for which there were no identified cases: (1) other firearm, (2) poison, (3) explosives, and (4) pushed/thrown from high place. *Id.*

62. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

63. *Id.*

64. *Id.* There were also five categories that had no identified homicides: gangland, juvenile gang, mercy killing, institutional, and sniper. *Id.*

10. Relationship of Offender and Victim

These relationships are divided by the report into three subcategories: (1) Within Family, (2) Outside Family, but Known to Each Other, and (3) Unknown to Each Other.⁶⁵ In the "Within Family" category, the breakdown relationship of the victim to the offender as follows:

Spouse	22
Common law spouse	18
Parent	6
Sibling	6
In-law	4
Stepparent	4
Stepchild	2
Grandparent	1
Grandchild	1
Other family member	16 ⁶⁶

Within the subcategory of "Outside the Family, but Known to Each Other," the breakdown categorizes the victim as follows:

Acquaintance	147
Boyfriend/Girlfriend	20
Friend	16
Ex-spouse	4
Neighbor	3
Child of boy/girlfriend	3
Homosexual relationship	3
Employer	1
Otherwise known	3 ⁶⁷

In the subcategory of "Unknown to Each Other," the breakdown was:

Victim was stranger	102
Relationship unknown	46 ⁶⁸

65. *Id.*

66. *Id.* Stepsibling was the one category with no entries. *Id.*

67. *Id.* There were two categories with no entries: Babysittee and Employee. *Id.*

68. *Id.*

The facts demonstrate that victims were much more likely to be killed by offenders known to them than by strangers.⁶⁹

11. Premises of Murder

The following figures indicate that a victim is by far more likely to be killed at home than anywhere else:

Residence/home	168
Highway/road/alley	46
Parking lot/garage	35
Bar/nightclub	21
Apartment/condo	17
Commercial/office building	8
Convenience store	8
Hotel/motel	4
Drugstore/doctor's office/hospital	2
Government/public building	2
Lake/waterway	2
Restaurant	2
Service/gas station	2
Specialty store	2
Department/discount store	1
Grocery/supermarket	1
School	1
Shopping mall	1
Other/unknown	19 ⁷⁰

69. See SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

70. *Id.* There were also several categories with no entries: Air/bus/train terminal, Bank/savings and loan, Church/synagogue/temple, Construction site, Jail/prison, Liquor store, Rental storage facility, College, and Highway rest area. *Id.*

12. Race/Gender/Age

OFFENDERS

<u>Offender's</u> <u>Age</u>	<u>Black</u> <u>Male</u>	<u>White</u> <u>Male</u>	<u>Black</u> <u>Female</u>	<u>White</u> <u>Female</u>
11-15	7	0	0	2
16-20	62	22	7	3
21-25	66	19	4	3
26-30	35	24	6	4
31-35	25	16	4	2
36-40	13	15	4	0
41-45	12	5	2	5
46-50	10	10	1	3
51-55	5	4	1	1
56-60	2	1	3	0
61-65	4	1	0	0
66-70	0	1	1	0
71-75	0	1	0	0
Total	241	119	33	23 ⁷¹

The vast predominance of male offenders is no surprise. It is a well-known and longstanding fact that males commit violent crimes far out of proportion to their approximately forty-nine percent representation in the population.⁷²

Women, acting alone, killed only people they knew.⁷³ Of the twenty-three solo women killers, the offender-victim relationships were as follows:

Common law spouses	10
Girlfriend/boyfriend	4
Acquaintance	3
Child/parent	1
Parent/child	1
Girlfriend/boyfriend's child	1
Spouses	1
Other family	1
Unknown	1 ⁷⁴

71. *Id.* There are far more offenders (416) than victims (305) because many of the homicides involved multiple offenders. *Id.* There are also several cases where the authorities had no information concerning the killer and therefore, these are not reflected in the Table.

72. CENSUS 2000, *supra* note 5, at <http://www.census.gov/prod/2001pubs/c2kbr01-9.pdf> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002); *see also* DEKESEREDY & SCHWARTZ, *supra* note 42 (stating that "murder is a crime essentially committed by men").

73. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

74. *Id.*

Remarkably, a woman acting alone did not kill a stranger in a single known instance in South Carolina in 1998.⁷⁵ It is only when acting in concert with others (almost always a male or males) that a woman was occasionally involved in the killing of a stranger.⁷⁶

The presence of black offenders is prominent.⁷⁷ According to the 2000 Census, 67.2% of South Carolina's total population of 4,012,012 was white (approximately 2,695,560 white residents).⁷⁸ With white offenders numbering 142 (119 male and 23 female),⁷⁹ the white offender rate per 100,000 white residents was 5.3. The 2000 Census data for blacks shows that 29.5% of the state's residents were black (approximately 1,185,216 black residents).⁸⁰ With 274 black offenders (241 male and 33 female),⁸¹ the black offender rate per 100,000 black residents was 23.2—more than four times the white rate of 5.3. This difference seems startling, but may indicate that the black homicide rate in South Carolina is lower than one might expect (or the white rate is higher, or both), given that in 1998 the nationwide black homicide rate was almost seven times higher than the white homicide rate.⁸²

The age breakdown is also enlightening. The peak of homicidal ages for all categories, except white females, is in the twenty-year span between ages 16 and 35.⁸³ However, black males tend to offend earlier with seven killers in the 11-15 age group, compared with none for white males.⁸⁴ The highest number of black, male killers are in the 16-20 and 21-25 age brackets, with a decrease in the 26-30 and 31-35 age brackets.⁸⁵ By contrast, the white, male killers are relatively evenly distributed in the age brackets of 16-20, 21-25, 26-30, 31-35, and 36-40 (22, 19, 24, 16, and 15, respectively).⁸⁶

The SLED report demonstrates the well-known fact that older people are less homicidal than younger adults.⁸⁷ In fact, there was a dramatic drop-off in offenders older than fifty-five.⁸⁸ The homicidal flame still flickered in the 50-55 year-old age bracket with eighteen killers, but burned very low after age

75. *Id.*

76. *Id.*

77. *Id.*

78. CENSUS2000, *supra* note 5, at http://www.census.gov/Press-Release/www/2001/tables/dp_sc_2000.pdf (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

79. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

80. CENSUS2000, *supra* note 5, at http://www.census.gov/Press-Release/www/2001/tables/dp_sc_2000.pdf (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

81. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

82. *See* SOURCEBOOK, *supra* note 4, at 304 (listing for 1998 a white offender rate nationwide of 4.1 and a black offender rate of 28.3).

83. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

84. *Id.*

85. *Id.*

86. *Id.*

87. *See* Alfred Blumstein & Richard Rosenfeld, *Explaining Recent Trends in U.S. Homicide Rates*, 88 J. CRIM. L. & CRIMINOLOGY 1175, 1186-87 (1998).

88. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

fifty-five with thirteen killers.⁸⁹ And the flame was extinguished after age sixty-six, the age of the two oldest offenders in the SLED report.⁹⁰

Further, offenders in the fifty-plus group almost exclusively killed people they knew.⁹¹ The offender/victim relationship breakdown for the thirty-one killers in the fifty-plus age group is as follows:

Acquaintances	8
Spouses	6
Homosexual lovers	4
Common law spouses	3
Step-parent/stepchild	2
Boyfriend/girlfriend	2
Other family	2
Ex-husband/ex-wife	1
Parent/child	1
Strangers	2 ⁹²

Only two fifty-and-over offenders killed a stranger, and those two acted together in the same homicide.⁹³

13. *Victims*

<u>Victim's</u> <u>Age</u>	<u>Black</u> <u>Male</u>	<u>White</u> <u>Male</u>	<u>Black</u> <u>Female</u>	<u>White</u> <u>Female</u>
0-5	7	3	2	1
6-10	0	0	2	1
11-15	0	0	0	0
16-20	25	2	5	3
21-25	31	16	4	3
26-30	19	7	8	4
31-35	14	11	2	10
36-40	8	6	8	4
41-45	10	6	4	8
46-50	9	5	1	2
51-55	3	6	2	1

89. *Id.*

90. *Id.*

91. *Id.*

92. *Id.*

93. *Id.*

2002]

A YEAR IN THE LIFE OF DEATH

265

56-60	4	4	3	2
61-65	2	2	0	2
66-70	0	4	0	0
71-75	1	5	1	2
76-80	0	1	0	1
81-85	2	2	0	0
TOTAL	135	80	42	44

Asian female 30-35: 1; Indian male 16-20: 2; and

Male race unknown 26-30: 1.

GRAND TOTAL: 305⁹⁴

Just as black males make up the largest category of offenders, they also make up the largest category of victims.⁹⁵ As to gender, while there is a predominance of male victims (approximately 67%), this predominance is not as pronounced in the offender category, where 86% were male.⁹⁶ As to age, it is interesting to find that very young children are more at risk of being killed than older children.⁹⁷ There were thirteen victims in the age group 0-5, but there were only three victims in the combined age groups of 6-10 and 11-15.⁹⁸ Young black males in the three age groups from 16-30 comprise a greater number of victims than any other five-year category for any other combination of race and gender.⁹⁹ The peak age for both black and white female victims is older than the peak age for either black or white males.¹⁰⁰

14. Alcohol/Drug Use

The figures indicate that forty-three victims had been using alcohol, three had been using drugs, and two had been using both alcohol and drugs.¹⁰¹ With respect to offenders, sixty-six had been using alcohol, six using drugs, and twelve using both alcohol and drugs.¹⁰² The accuracy and completeness of this tabulation is somewhat suspect because the information does not come from autopsies, rather it comes from the reports of police officers on the scene who may or may not be able to ascertain which, if either, of the parties were using alcohol or drugs.

94. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

95. *Id.*

96. *Id.*

97. *Id.*

98. *Id.*

99. *Id.*

100. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

101. *Id.*

102. *Id.*

15. *Active/Cleared*

Forty-one of the cases were still active as of December 31, 1999, the closing date for the SLED report which is one year following the end of the calendar year 1998.¹⁰³ Two hundred and sixty-two cases had been cleared: 244 of them by arrest, seventeen by the death of the offender, and one because prosecution was declined.¹⁰⁴ Two cases had been “administratively closed,” which means the police agency had no leads and closed the investigation.¹⁰⁵ These figures are somewhat skewed in favor of clearance because in a multiple offender case, if there is even one arrest, the case is counted as cleared even if less than all of the offenders have been arrested.

16. *Other Crimes*

Often the homicide was committed while the offender was in the process of committing another crime.¹⁰⁶ The SLED report shows the following on this point:

Multiple homicides	19 ¹⁰⁷
Robbery	57
Aggravated assault ¹⁰⁸	39
Breaking and entering	10
Arson	6
Sexual assault	6
Kidnap	5
Simple assault	4
Weapon law violation	4
Drug offense	3
Larceny	3
Motor vehicle theft	1
Prostitution	1 ¹⁰⁹

103. *Id.*

104. *Id.*

105. *Id.*

106. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

107. *Id.* This number reflects the total of eight double homicides and one triple homicide.

108. In South Carolina, attempted murder is considered aggravated assault. *See CRIME IN SOUTH CAROLINA*, *supra* note 6, at 21.

109. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

Sometimes these other crimes did not occur in isolation, but in conjunction with other crimes.¹¹⁰ The combinations as reported are as follows:

Breaking and entering/robbery	6
Robbery/sexual assault	2
Robbery/kidnapping	2
Robbery/weapon law violation	2
Robbery/drugs	1
Breaking and entering/arson	1
Breaking and entering/simple assault	1
Drug offense/weapon law violation	1
Sexual assault/larceny	1
Kidnap/aggravated assault	1
Kidnap/larceny	1
Aggravated assault/simple assault	1
Arson/aggravated assault	1
Breaking and entering/robbery/kidnapping	1 ¹¹¹

C. Correlation Between the Race and Gender of Suspects and Victims

The table below is limited to cases that were reported to have a single offender. It would be impossible to incorporate multiple offender cases, where the offenders are sometimes of different races, in a table like the following:¹¹²

110. *Id.*

111. *Id.*

112. The homicides involving a single victim and multiple offenders were also largely along racial lines. *Id.*

As to multiple offenders' there were thirty-six homicides where a black victim was killed by black offenders, and there were seventeen homicides where a white victim was killed by white offenders. *Id.* As to homicides where the victim was one race and the offenders were all another race there were eleven homicides where a white victim was killed by black offenders and one homicide where a black victim was killed by white offenders. *Id.* Finally, there were instances where the offenders were of different races: there were five cases where a white victim was killed by multiple offenders that included both blacks and whites, and there were three cases where a black victim was killed by multiple offenders that included offenders of both races. *Id.*

As to cases with multiple victims, four of the ten episodes involved multiple black victims killed by one or more black offenders. *Id.* In three other cases, all the victims were black, and (1) all the killers were white; (2) the killer's race was unknown; and (3) one of the offenders was black and the other offender's race was not listed. *Id.* In one case, both of the victims were white, and there were two black offenders and two white offenders. *Id.* In the final two cases, there was one black victim and one white victim, and in one case the single offender was black, while in the other case both offenders were black. *Id.*

SINGLE OFFENDER/VICTIM CORRELATION BY RACE/GENDER

	VICTIM			
	<u>Black</u>	<u>White</u>	<u>Black</u>	<u>White</u>
<i>Offender</i>				
Black male	61	5	30	7
White male	3	29	0	28
Black female	12	1	2	0
White female	0	6	0	1

TOTAL INTRARACIAL: 169

TOTAL INTERRACIAL: 16¹¹³

This table vividly illustrates the well-known fact that the vast majority of killings are intraracial rather than interracial.¹¹⁴ Black males predominantly killed black males, and secondarily, black females.¹¹⁵ White males predominantly killed white males and, at about the same rate, white females.¹¹⁶ Black females killed almost exclusively black males; white females killed almost exclusively white males.¹¹⁷

Of the interracial killings by lone offenders, in thirteen instances blacks killed whites; in only three instances did whites kill blacks.¹¹⁸ The range of situations in which interracial homicides were committed ran the gamut: four fatal domestic disputes (three between boyfriends and girlfriends, one between ex-spouses); three acquaintances; one drug dispute; three robberies of a stranger; one rape of an acquaintance; one killing by an employer; one killing of a sheriff's deputy; and two for unknown reasons.¹¹⁹

I did a further breakdown of the above data incorporating the variable of age. This breakdown turned out not to be very suggestive, except to point out that the four highest offender-victim combinations all involved black males: six instances where a black male offender age 16 to 20 killed a black male victim age 16 to 20; six instances where a black male offender age 16 to 20 killed a black male victim age 21 to 25; four instances where a black male offender age 21 to 25 killed a black male victim age 16 to 20; and four instances where a black male offender age 21 to 25 killed a black male victim age 21 to 25.¹²⁰

113. *Id.*

114. *Id.*; see also DEKESEREDY & SCHWARTZ, *supra* note 42, at 295 (stating that murder is mainly an intraracial crime).

115. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

116. *Id.*

117. *Id.*

118. *Id.*

119. *Id.*

120. *Id.*

The relative predominance of black offenders and victims, and the fact that most killings are intraracial, led me to create Appendix F, which lists the counties in decreasing percentage of black population and their corresponding homicide rates.¹²¹ One would expect to see a correlation between higher percentages of black population with higher homicide rates, and this is partially borne out by the data.¹²² All five counties with the highest homicide rates were in the top fifteen counties in black population.¹²³ On the other hand, only two of the ten counties with the lowest percentage of black population had homicide rates exceeding the state rate, and one had a homicide rate equaling the state rate.¹²⁴

However, there is an interesting counter-trend: the county with the highest percentage of black population (71%) was one of the three counties with no homicides at all; one of the other counties with no homicides had a majority (54%) of black residents; and the third no-homicide county had a percentage of black residents (43%), well above the statewide percentage (29.5%).¹²⁵

Of course, racially-based data is emotionally charged. By reporting this data, I certainly do not mean to assert (or even imply) that blacks are more homicide-prone because of their race. The social factors in the homicide mix are so many, varied, and intertwined that it would be foolhardy to assert that any one factor has any particular causal nexus. Two sets of data in particular have interactive effects: race and poverty.¹²⁶ A correlation between low income and homicide rates already has been shown.¹²⁷ Since blacks generally have lower incomes, it could well be that poverty is a primary causal factor of homicides, and race is merely incidental.

III. AN ANALYSIS BASED ON INFORMATION FROM NEWSPAPERS

A. *The Case Sample and the Process of Assembling It*

My plan when I began this project was to find details about all 305 homicides in newspaper reports available on-line.¹²⁸ The best sources for newspapers online were Westlaw and Lexis. Between the two, I discovered four South Carolina newspapers that were fully available on-line for the relevant time period: *The Post and Courier* (Charleston), *The Sun News* (Myrtle Beach), *The Herald* (Rock Hill), and *The State* (Columbia). I also found the *Beaufort Gazette* available starting January 1, 2000, and it contained

121. See *infra* Appendix F.

122. See *infra* Appendix F.

123. See *infra* Appendix F.

124. See *infra* Appendix F.

125. See *infra* Appendix F.

126. DEKESEREDY & SCHWARTZ, *supra* note 42, at 312-14.

127. See *supra* text accompanying notes 42-49.

128. All of these news reports, which number in the hundreds, are on file with the author.

information about only one 1998 homicide where the offenders were arrested long after the incident.

The process of searching for news articles about the homicides was painstaking, since the SLED printout did not provide the names of either the offenders or the victims to use as search terms. Thus, I had to resort to using the very broad search term of "murder," which generated thousands of "hits." Then, I had to briefly review each hit to see whether it pertained to a murder that occurred in South Carolina during 1998. Once I ascertained that a news report did relate to such an event, I correlated it with the homicides on the SLED report by matching dates of occurrence, ages of victims, geographic locations, and other categories. Through this process, I retrieved news reports concerning 159 of the 305 homicides in the report. Surprisingly, I discovered ten additional homicides through the news reports that could not be correlated with any of the 305 homicides in the report. Thus, I concluded that there were some difficulties in the statewide reporting system in South Carolina resulting in homicides not being reported to SLED.¹²⁹ Indeed, since I found ten additional homicides in the newspapers I searched that covered only about half the cases in the SLED printout, it would be reasonable to surmise that another ten or so additional cases exist.¹³⁰ Thus, I ended up with information about 169 homicides, 159 of which were listed in the printout.

While I did not succeed in my mission of obtaining detailed information about all 305 homicides, I believe that the 169 homicides for which I did find information provide a fair cross-section for analysis. Clearly, the sample is skewed in two ways. First, I got virtually complete coverage of the locales in which the various newspapers were headquartered, such as, Charleston and Berkeley Counties (*The Post and Courier*), Horry County (*The Sun News*), York County (*The Herald*), and Lexington and Richland Counties (*The State*). Second, because two of the state's three largest metropolitan areas, Charleston and Columbia,¹³¹ were included in this full coverage, my sample is somewhat biased in the direction of urban homicides.

129. Lt. Jerry Hamby tracked down what had happened to nine of the ten missing cases. E-mail from Jerry Hamby, Lieutenant, South Carolina Law Enforcement Division, to David McCord, Associate Dean and Professor of Law, Drake Law School (Aug. 8, 2001) (on file with author). He discovered that in three instances the local police agency had completely failed to report the homicide to SLED; in five instances (including a triple homicide in Marion County), the local agency had mistakenly reported the homicide as an aggravated assault; and in one case, where the robbery victim died of a heart attack, the local agency had correctly not reported it as a homicide because it did not meet Uniform Crime Reporting criteria because the offender inflicted no physical injury on the victim. *Id.* Of course, under felony murder principles, that homicide is still a murder. Thus, I will continue to include it in my sample. There was one case missing that Lt. Hamby could not explain. *Id.*

130. An additional twenty homicides would raise the South Carolina homicide rate for 1998 from 7.6 per 100,000 to 8.1 per 100,000. See *supra* notes 17-18 and accompanying text.

131. See *infra* Appendix A.

B. *Categories of Homicides*

In attempting to discern patterns among the homicides, I undertook to categorize them in a way that seemed natural, according to the details I could learn from the newspaper reports. Author David Simon, commenting about Baltimore homicides, stated that there are only “rare victims for whom death is not the inevitable consequence of a long-running domestic feud or a stunted pharmaceutical career.”¹³² My research shows that Simon has overstated the rarity of victims outside those two milieus (assuming the range of South Carolina homicides is roughly similar to Baltimore’s), although domestic and drug-related homicides loom large in my sample, too.

Before I relate the results of that categorization effort, I must acknowledge the somewhat inexact nature of my effort. There were several drawbacks that might have led me to incorrectly categorize a given case. First, sometimes a case fell into more than one category. For example, in one case a son burglarized his mother’s house, robbed, and bludgeoned her with a hammer.¹³³ I could have classified the case as a domestic one since it involved a son and mother, or as a homicide committed during another felony (i.e., burglary and robbery). In such an overlapping situation, I used my best judgment. The second pitfall is that many of the news reports provided scant information and thus, may not have reported a salient fact that would have made a difference between placing the homicide in one category rather than another. Further, the news reports themselves may have contained inaccuracies.

Despite these possible sources of inaccuracy, my categorization effort still has value. The point was to get a general overview of the types of homicides, and for this purpose, it matters little if I misclassified a few cases because the general outlines of the pattern are still definite and easily ascertainable. Herewith, then, is the result of my categorization effort:

Domestic:		67
Male/female relationships		
Spontaneous	20	
Planned: stalking, luring, etc.	7	
Planned: conspiracy	2	
Murder/suicide	8	
Collateral victim	8	
Child victim	12	
Other relationships	10	
Acquaintance disputes		29
Stranger disputes		13

132. See SIMON, *supra* note 1, at 164.

133. See *infra* Appendix R at no.23.

Arising in a bar/nightclub	9	
Others	4	
Drug disputes		14
During another felony		30
Insufficient information to categorize		16
TOTAL		169 ¹³⁴

One important pattern here, as was also true in Part II from the SLED report, is that victims are more likely to be killed by persons they know (domestic relationships or acquaintances) than by strangers.¹³⁵ Adding the sixty-seven cases of domestic grievances and twenty-nine acquaintance disputes, ninety-six of the 169 homicide victims (57%) were killed by someone the victim knew, often very well.¹³⁶ Indeed, this slightly understates the percentage because many of the fourteen drug dispute killings probably involved people who were acquainted, albeit in a nefarious manner, and a few of the killings that occurred during another felony were between persons who knew each other well.¹³⁷ Another important pattern is that the largest single category of homicides arose out of male/female relationships gone awry—a total of forty-five.¹³⁸

A third striking fact is that the whole milieu of alcohol and drugs is, unsurprisingly, a violent one. While outside the context of the commission of a homicide during another felony, strangers relatively infrequently kill each other; over two-thirds of the incidents (nine out of thirteen) where they did so involved bars/nightclubs.¹³⁹ In addition, fourteen homicides arose out of illegal drug disputes.¹⁴⁰ Further, many of the domestic grievance killings were, according to the news reports, fueled by alcohol.¹⁴¹ I suspect that many others involved alcohol or drugs, but were not so reported in the newspapers.

C. General Observations Regarding Newsworthiness

The pattern I observed in newspapers' reporting of homicides had several interesting and sometimes surprising aspects. First, there was a great disparity among the homicides concerning how much publicity each received. While there were 169 homicides in my sample, there were only 159 criminal incidents that gave rise to them—six incidents involved double homicides, and two triple

134. See *infra* Appendices G-S.

135. See *supra* notes 64-70 and accompanying text.

136. See *supra* note 134 and accompanying text.

137. See *infra* Appendices Q-R.

138. See *supra* note 134 and accompanying text.

139. See *supra* note 134 and accompanying text.

140. See *supra* note 134 and accompanying text.

141. See *infra* Appendices G-N.

legal outcomes because in quite a few of the cases there were multiple offenders and thus multiple legal outcomes, yet the media did not report the outcome with respect to each of the offenders.¹⁵³ Apparently, the legal outcome of homicide cases is deemed by the media to be newsworthy only sporadically.

D. Summaries of Categories and Newsworthiness Therein

Below are descriptions of the thirteen categories into which I placed the cases, including insights about the crimes themselves, and comments about the perceived newsworthiness of cases in each category. Each category has a corresponding appendix that lists all the cases in the category along with the date of the homicide, the county of the homicide, the number and placement of the news reports, and a brief description of the homicide.¹⁵⁴

*1. Domestic—Male/Female Relationship—Spontaneous*¹⁵⁵

By “spontaneous,” I mean that it appeared from the news reports that the homicides occurred in “hot blood” when there was an argument and a weapon handy. It is possible that some of these homicides should be classified in the next category of “Planned: Stalking, Luring, etc.” rather than as “spontaneous.” But I am confident that the twenty homicides I have classified as “spontaneous” were not thoroughly planned in advance.

In twelve cases a male killed a female, while in eight cases a female killed a male.¹⁵⁶ Thus, this category contains a relative abundance of female offenders (40%), given that offenders in South Carolina were only 14% female.¹⁵⁷

Firearms were by far the weapon of choice in this category: fourteen slayings occurred with firearms, two with knives and two by strangulation.¹⁵⁸

The spectrum of relationships in this category included husband and wife living together, estranged husband and wife, common-law husband and wife, boyfriend and girlfriend living together, boyfriend and girlfriend not living together, and ex-boyfriend and girlfriend.¹⁵⁹

None of these cases garnered “significant” news coverage.¹⁶⁰

153. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

154. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

155. *See infra* Appendix G.

156. *See infra* Appendix G.

157. *See* SLED Report, *supra* note 6; *see also supra* notes 70-76 and accompanying text.

158. *See infra* Appendix G.

159. *See infra* Appendix G.

160. *See infra* Appendix G.

homicides, and the multiple homicides were always reported together.¹⁴² Of the 159 incidents, I counted the news reports concerning each and categorized the coverage as “extensive” if there were more than ten articles. Only nine cases received extensive coverage.¹⁴³ I classified a case that received between six and ten news reports as receiving “significant” coverage. There were only eighteen such cases.¹⁴⁴ Cases that were reported three to five times in the newspapers I categorized as receiving “modest” coverage. There were thirty-nine such cases.¹⁴⁵ Finally, the cases that were reported only once or twice I categorized as receiving “minimal” publicity. This was by far the largest category, with ninety-three cases.¹⁴⁶

Thus, the “minimal” newsworthiness category accounted for more cases than the other three categories combined.¹⁴⁷ Apparently homicide, while the most serious of crimes, is not inherently more than minimally newsworthy in the eyes of the press unless it contains some feature to distinguish it from the “ordinary” homicide. In subpart D each category of homicide will be examined, and I will point out the cases that were deemed worthy of “extensive” or “significant” coverage and try to discern some reasons why those cases stood out to the media.

A second crucial feature of the news reporting was the intensely local nature of the coverage. Most cases were reported only in a paper in the locality of the homicide.¹⁴⁸ Even the cases that received “extensive” coverage, all received most of their reporting in one paper in the local area.¹⁴⁹ Apparently, homicides are not inherently newsworthy outside the locality where they occurred, except for a very few cases that attract some outside media attention.

Finally, I was surprised with the infrequency with which the newspapers reported the legal outcomes of the cases. Subtracting from the 159 incidents twenty-nine cases in which there was no legal resolution to report—twelve cases in which the offender died and seventeen cases in which the police made no arrest¹⁵⁰—there remained 130 incidents about which newspapers could have reported the outcomes (unless cases were still pending as of the writing of this article, which would be true only if an offender were arrested much belatedly—I am aware of only one instance in which this is the case).¹⁵¹ Of these 130 cases, I found reports of the legal outcomes of only forty-four of them (34%).¹⁵² Indeed, even this percentage overstates the newsworthiness of

142. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

143. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

144. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

145. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

146. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

147. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

148. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

149. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

150. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

151. *See infra* Appendix R at no.18.

152. *See infra* Appendices G-S.

2. *Domestic Male/Female Relationship—Planned: Stalking, Luring, etc.*¹⁶¹

The common theme that binds these seven cases together is that the offender, a male in all seven cases, engaged in significant planning by taking a gun with him to confront a female in a location the male would not otherwise have been.¹⁶² In all cases, the weapon causing the death was a firearm.¹⁶³ Two of these cases reached the level of “significant” reporting.¹⁶⁴ In one, the offender broke into his ex-wife’s house, shot her several times with a shotgun, and told the police how much he had enjoyed doing it.¹⁶⁵ In the other case, the ex-boyfriend offender stalked and killed his ex-girlfriend after she had sought help from the police and the court system.¹⁶⁶

3. *Domestic Male/Female Relationship—Planned: Conspiracy*¹⁶⁷

There are only two cases in this category, and in both of them the offenders were female.¹⁶⁸ In one case, an ex-girlfriend offender hired five other offenders to “teach her ex-boyfriend a lesson”; one of the five shot the victim as he stepped off a bus.¹⁶⁹ Apparently, this was more of a “lesson” than the ex-girlfriend had bargained for. Although this was a highly unusual kind of homicide, it garnered only “modest” publicity.¹⁷⁰

The other case was one of the nine cases that garnered “extensive” media attention.¹⁷¹ Indeed, the newsworthiness of this homicide is apparent; it was the most “tabloid-worthy” of all the 1998 South Carolina homicides. The offender wife conspired with her lover to have the lover kill her husband while the wife and the husband were walking on the beach during a trip to celebrate their third anniversary.¹⁷² The wife and lover’s alibi was that the husband was killed by an unknown robber on the beach.¹⁷³

161. *See infra* Appendix H.

162. *See infra* Appendix H.

163. *See infra* Appendix H.

164. *See infra* Appendix H at nos.2-3.

165. *See infra* Appendix H at no.2. The prosecution played the tape of the defendant’s confession that included the following excerpt: “I popped another shell into her. It felt good. Popped another shell into her. It felt better. Popped another shell into her. It felt even better. Popped one in her abdomen, popped one in her chest, her heart, one in her guts.” Bobbie Young, *Weik’s Taped Confession Played at Shooting Trial*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 27, 1999, at B1. The medical examiner testified that the defendant had shot the victim with a shotgun five or six times. *Id.*

166. *See infra* Appendix H at no.3.

167. *See infra* Appendix I.

168. *See infra* Appendix I.

169. *See infra* Appendix I at no.1.

170. *See infra* Appendix I at no.1.

171. *See infra* Appendix I at no.2.

172. *See infra* Appendix I at no.2.

173. *See infra* Appendix I at no.2.

4. *Domestic Male/Female Relationship—Murder/Suicide*¹⁷⁴

The eight cases in this category would have fallen into either the “Spontaneous” or the “Planned: Stalking, Luring, etc.” except for the additional fact that the male offender not only killed the female, but killed himself as well.¹⁷⁵

In all eight cases, the offender used a firearm to commit the murder and suicide combination.¹⁷⁶ Four of the eight cases involved husbands and wives, two involved boyfriends and girlfriends, and the remaining two cases involved ex-boyfriends and ex-girlfriends.¹⁷⁷ None of these cases received more than two mentions in the press.¹⁷⁸ But this is not surprising, since there is little left to report after the offender is dead.

5. *Domestic Male/Female Relationships: Collateral Victim*¹⁷⁹

In these eight cases, all involving male offenders and firearms, the offender shot to death another male as part of a dispute involving a female.¹⁸⁰ In four cases, the offender shot the female as well, but in three of them she survived.¹⁸¹ In five cases, the offender shot another male who the offender apparently perceived as vying for the female’s affection.¹⁸² In two cases, the offender shot a male whom was with the female as an escort for her protection; in one case, the offender shot a deputy sheriff and in the other case, the offender shot the female’s son, who was the stepson of the offender.¹⁸³ In the last case, the offender killed a former boyfriend who was beating the ex-girlfriend.¹⁸⁴

Only one of these cases garnered even “modest” news reports.¹⁸⁵ It seems that the double-killing involving the deputy sheriff could be expected to receive more publicity,¹⁸⁶ but the SLED report indicates that in that case the offender was in the “Dead” category.¹⁸⁷ Although the news report does not indicate how he died, if he died shortly after the double homicide in a shootout with the police, then there was probably little left to report.

174. *See infra* Appendix J.

175. *See infra* Appendix J.

176. *See infra* Appendix J.

177. *See infra* Appendix J.

178. *See infra* Appendix J.

179. *See infra* Appendix K.

180. *See infra* Appendix K.

181. *See infra* Appendix K at nos.1-2, 5, 8.

182. *See infra* Appendix K at nos.1-3, 7-8.

183. *See infra* Appendix K at nos.4-5.

184. *See infra* Appendix K at no.6.

185. *See infra* Appendix K at no.7.

186. *See infra* Appendix K at no.5.

187. *See* SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

6. *Domestic—Child Victim*¹⁸⁸

In ten of these twelve cases, the child victim was killed by a relative.¹⁸⁹ Four of the cases can be classified as “standard” child abuse cases in which a victim two years old or younger was killed by being struck, shaken, etc., by an offender who probably had no intent to inflict deadly injuries.¹⁹⁰ One other case involved death by beating, probably without intent to inflict mortal injuries, but the case stands out because the victim was significantly older (age six), and the victim’s aunt and two adolescent children inflicted the beating.¹⁹¹

Two of the cases involved death by arson.¹⁹² In one case, the offender went to the home of her boyfriend, the father of the two-year-old victim, fought with the father, and started a fire that killed the victim.¹⁹³ In the other arson case, the offender, the child’s father, poured gasoline around a van in which his two-year-old daughter was sitting and set it afire, burning her to death.¹⁹⁴

Five of the cases involved intentional killing not involving arson.¹⁹⁵ Two of the cases involved an apparent double homicide, even though the homicides were committed several days apart.¹⁹⁶ The offender, a relative, drowned the four-year-old victim in a pond behind her home, the death originally being ruled accidental.¹⁹⁷ Ten days later the first victim’s five-year-old brother was found suffocated in a car, a victim of the same offender.¹⁹⁸ In one of the other intentional killing cases, the father and mother of an infant had sexually abused the infant for two months before conspiring to kill him for fear doctors would discover evidence of the abuse on the next visit; the father smothered the infant with a pillow.¹⁹⁹ In another case, the offender sexually abused and asphyxiated the victim.²⁰⁰ In the final case, perhaps the most bizarre homicide about which I found a report, the offender lived in a mobile home next door to his sister and her family.²⁰¹ The offender became unhappy because his sister had no milk for his cereal, so he went to his mobile home, got a gun, and fired several shots into the sister’s mobile home, killing his seven-year-old niece.²⁰²

188. *See infra* Appendix L.

189. *See infra* Appendix L.

190. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.1-3, 8.

191. *See infra* Appendix L at no.9.

192. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.5, 12.

193. *See infra* Appendix L at no.5.

194. *See infra* Appendix L at no.12.

195. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.4, 6-7, 10-11.

196. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.10-11.

197. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.10-11.

198. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.10-11.

199. *See infra* Appendix L at no.6.

200. *See infra* Appendix L at no.4.

201. *See infra* Appendix L at no.7.

202. *See infra* Appendix L at no.7.

This category of cases scored well in terms of newsworthiness. Three of the nine cases that received “extensive” news coverage were in this category.²⁰³ Further, the double homicide of the young brother and sister by a relative garnered “significant” coverage.²⁰⁴

7. *Domestic—Other Relationships*²⁰⁵

These homicides involved killings within families that did not fall into any of the former categories. The offender and victim relationships were as follows: son/parent (three); stepson/stepparent (three); brother/brother (three); and father/adult child (one).²⁰⁶ It should be noted that all the offenders in this category were male, except that in one case the offender son was aided by his female cousin in killing the offender’s mother.²⁰⁷ Only one of these cases garnered “significant” press coverage.²⁰⁸

8. *Acquaintance Disputes*²⁰⁹

This large category is very much a mixed bag. It involves a host of scenarios where the offender and the victim knew each other fairly well.²¹⁰ The content of the dispute that led to the homicide is rarely explained in any detail in the news reports.²¹¹ The only identifiable subcategory (six cases) can be termed “planned revenge” killings, where the offender(s) and the victim had an earlier dispute, and the offender(s) came back after a significant time lapse with a firearm and killed the victim.²¹²

On the whole, cases in this category were not deemed very newsworthy by the media. There was one case that was one of the nine statewide where I found “extensive” press coverage—four young male offenders had an ongoing dispute with the victim’s friend.²¹³ The four lay in wait outside an apartment and fired guns when the friend and the victim emerged.²¹⁴ The friend was unharmed but the victim died from a single shotgun pellet that severed his artery.²¹⁵ One other case received “significant” coverage.²¹⁶ The victim was arguing with acquaintances, and the offender tried to break up the fight and

203. See *infra* Appendix L at nos.6, 9, 12.

204. See *infra* Appendix L at nos.10-11.

205. See *infra* Appendix M.

206. See *infra* Appendix M.

207. See *infra* Appendix M at no.10.

208. See *infra* Appendix M at no.10.

209. See *infra* Appendix N.

210. See *infra* Appendix N.

211. See *infra* Appendix N.

212. See *infra* Appendix N at nos.2, 6, 10, 17-18, 29.

213. See *infra* Appendix N at no.29.

214. See *infra* Appendix N at no.29.

215. See *infra* Appendix N at no.29.

216. See *infra* Appendix N at no.25.

began arguing with the victim.²¹⁷ The offender and the victim then fought, and the offender stabbed the victim fifteen times.²¹⁸

9. *Stranger Disputes—Arising in a Bar/Nightclub*²¹⁹

The theme uniting these cases is that the homicides were relatively spontaneous occurrences between an offender and a victim around a bar, usually in a parking lot.²²⁰ While the news reports do not usually indicate that drinking was involved, one might readily assume that is often the case.

Only one of these cases reached the level of “significant” newsworthiness: the offender shot two South Carolina State University students in the parking lot of a nightclub during an argument.²²¹

10. *Stranger Disputes—Others*²²²

There were four cases involving killings by strangers (not in the course of another felony) that did not occur in or around bars or nightclubs.²²³ The news reports are sparse concerning what sparked these homicidal encounters and no unifying theme can be ascertained.²²⁴ None of the four cases obtained the level of “significant” press coverage.

11. *Drug Disputes*²²⁵

The illegal drug scene is a dangerous one. Fourteen cases clearly fall into this category,²²⁶ and it is certainly possible that some of the acquaintance and stranger disputes I classified earlier actually were drug disputes that cannot be identified as such from the news reports. Also noteworthy is that there were only two incidents in South Carolina in 1998 where there were as many as three homicides involved in a criminal episode, and both cases fall into the drug dispute category—one a triple homicide in Lancaster County and the other in Marion County.²²⁷

Several drug-dispute homicides also involved burglary or robbery.²²⁸ I chose not to classify them in the next category, “During Another Felony,” because I have reserved that category for instances where the victims were

217. See *infra* Appendix N at no.25.

218. See *infra* Appendix N at no.25.

219. See *infra* Appendix O.

220. See *infra* Appendix O.

221. See *infra* Appendix O at nos.7-8.

222. See *infra* Appendix P.

223. See *infra* Appendix P.

224. See *infra* Appendix P.

225. See *infra* Appendix Q.

226. See *infra* Appendix Q.

227. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4, 7-9.

228. See *infra* Appendix Q.

innocent, unlike the victims in the drug dispute category who were involved in illicit activity.

All the offenders and victims in these drug dispute cases were males, and all the homicides were committed by firearms.²²⁹

Two cases in this category attracted the media.²³⁰ One of them, the triple homicide in Lancaster County, was one of the nine cases that received "extensive" publicity.²³¹ A singular fact about the case was that the three offenders were white, but the three victims were black.²³² I hypothesize that it was the interracial aspect of this case, as well as the fact that three murders were committed, that attracted such significant press attention. The interracial aspect was more significant, inasmuch as the other triple homicide, involving all black offenders and victims, scarcely made a ripple in the press.²³³

*12. During Another Felony*²³⁴

The predominant theme of this category is homicides committed during the course of a robbery or attempted robbery. This large category includes thirty cases involving twenty-eight criminal episodes (because two of the cases involve double homicides).²³⁵ All but two of these twenty-eight episodes involved robbery or attempted robbery, although sometimes the robbery was combined with additional offenses.²³⁶

Of the twenty-six episodes involving robbery, thirteen of them could be classified as "plain" robberies to obtain money, jewelry, or other valuable items.²³⁷ Five other homicides were carjackings.²³⁸ The other eight episodes involved robbery plus some other crime: robbery plus burglary of a home or business (six),²³⁹ and robbery plus kidnapping (two).²⁴⁰

In the two episodes not involving robbery, one involved the additional crime of rape.²⁴¹ The other involved one homicide followed by another homicide committed after a lapse of time to cover for the first homicide.²⁴² Specifically, a female offender offered a man money to kill her daughter-in-law; apparently he declined.²⁴³ The woman then hired another man, who did

229. *See infra* Appendix Q.

230. *See infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4, 7-9.

231. *See infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4.

232. *See infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4.

233. *See infra* Appendix Q at nos.7-9.

234. *See infra* Appendix R.

235. *See infra* Appendix R.

236. *See infra* Appendix R.

237. *See infra* Appendix R at nos.2, 8-10, 13-14, 19-20, 23-27, 29.

238. *See infra* Appendix R at nos.3, 11, 17, 21, 28.

239. *See infra* Appendix R at nos.5-7, 12, 18, 30.

240. *See infra* Appendix R at nos.1, 22.

241. *See infra* Appendix R at no.4.

242. *See infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

243. *See infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

kill her daughter-in-law; then the hit man and the woman killed the man who had declined to perform the hit.²⁴⁴

Cases in this category were, on average, the most newsworthy in South Carolina during 1998. Three of the cases were among the nine statewide that received “extensive” publicity—a popular high school student shot four times in an attempted carjacking, three offenders robbed a Sam’s Club store by forcing the victim-employee to open the safe, then closed him in the trunk of a car and burned the vehicle, and four offenders shot a high school student victim in an attempted carjacking.²⁴⁵ Furthermore, nine additional cases received “significant” press coverage.²⁴⁶

*13. Insufficient Information to Categorize*²⁴⁷

In sixteen cases, I found insufficient information in the news reports to categorize the cases as falling into any of the former categories.²⁴⁸ In fourteen cases, according to the news reports, this was due to the police having no leads in the homicide.²⁴⁹ Thus, there was no basis upon which I could categorize them, given that the relationship between the victim and the offender was unknown. In the other two cases, the offender had been arrested, but the sparse details in the news articles did not enable me to categorize the homicide.²⁵⁰

Unsurprisingly, since there was no follow-up to report in the fourteen cases where no offender was identified, these cases did not rank high in terms of newsworthiness. However, one of the cases did reach the level of “significant” news coverage.²⁵¹

Thus, these are the contours of homicide in South Carolina during 1998: a deadly brew of personal relationships gone awry and contemporaneous felonies escalated, all in a culture rife with guns, drugs, and liquor. It remains to be examined in Part IV which of these homicides did or did not prompt a deadly response from the state in the form of a death sentence.

244. This account is pieced together from two sources. *State v. Stokes*, 345 S.C. 368, 371-72, 548 S.E.2d 202, 203-04 (2001); *Woman Gets Life in Prison For Role in Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 20, 1999, at 7A.

245. See *infra* Appendix R at nos. 11, 18, 21.

246. See *infra* Appendix R at nos. 3-4, 12, 15-16, 25, 27, 29-30.

247. See *infra* Appendix S.

248. See *infra* Appendix S.

249. See *infra* Appendix S at nos. 1-5, 7-9, 11-16.

250. See *infra* Appendix S at nos. 6, 10.

251. See *infra* Appendix S at no. 11.

IV. CAPITAL SENTENCES

A. *Introduction*

I did not find news reports relating to all 305 homicides, and even as to many homicides about which I did find news reports, I did not find resolutions. Nonetheless, I do know how many persons were sentenced to death for homicides committed in South Carolina during 1998: three—Michael Passaro, Sammie L. Stokes, and John E. Weik.²⁵² I ascertained this by checking the list of seventy persons on South Carolina's death row as of January 1, 2001, and ascertaining when their crimes were committed.²⁵³ By this process, I isolated the three offenders who ended up on South Carolina's death row for homicides committed there during 1998.

In the subparts below, I will examine three crucial issues in the death penalty debate as they relate to South Carolina homicides during 1998. First, I will examine whether the problem of "overinclusion" exists. Overinclusion is the imposition of death sentences on defendants who are not among the worst murderers.²⁵⁴ Second, I will explore whether "underinclusion" is demonstrated; that is, whether death sentences were imposed on only some rather than all of the worst murderers.²⁵⁵ Finally, I will examine whether racial patterns exist.

B. *The Worst Cases*

Supreme Court jurisprudence establishes that states imposing the death penalty must have a mechanism for assuring that death sentences are imposed only upon a class of murderers who are somehow "worse" than other

252. DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002) (This information is provided by the efforts of the NAACP Legal Defense and Education Fund in its quarterly publication, *Death Row USA*.).

253. *Id.*

254. Indisputably, one of the key concerns behind the United States Supreme Court's regulation of the administration of the death penalty since 1972 has been to minimize overinclusion. See Carol S. Steiker & Jordan M. Steiker, *Sober Second Thoughts: Reflections on Two Decades of Constitutional Regulation of Capital Punishment*, 109 HARV. L. REV. 355, 365-69 (1995) (offering an illuminating review of the Court's caselaw on this point).

255. While some commentators believe the Supreme Court death penalty doctrine has been significantly influenced by the Court's distaste for underinclusion, I have argued elsewhere that the only sort of underinclusion about which the Court has been concerned is invidious (mostly racial) underinclusion, and the Court has in fact imposed constitutional requirements, such as giving the defendant an opportunity to present mitigating evidence that in fact foster merits-based underinclusion. See David McCord, *Judging the Effectiveness of the Supreme Court's Death Penalty Jurisprudence According to the Court's Own Goals: Mild Success or Major Disaster?*, 24 FLA. ST. U. L. REV. 545, 567-75 (1997).

murderers.²⁵⁶ Most states have accomplished this objective by defining “aggravating circumstances.”²⁵⁷ I have discovered through many years of death-penalty research and reading hundreds of appellate cases, that there are several recurring factors tending to make a case death-eligible in the eyes of most prosecutors and jurors.²⁵⁸ Some of these factors are captured quite well by a state’s definition of aggravating circumstances; some exist more as a matter of common sense. I will now undertake to rank the worst homicides in South Carolina during 1998 by reference to these common factors.

I will use a method of my own devising based on “depravity points.” I assigned one depravity point for each of the following common sense exacerbating factors that exist in a case:

Additional Attempted Murder
 Additional Murder
 Arson
 Burglary
 Child Victim
 Clear Premeditation
 Horrendous Method (anything other than one or two gunshots or knife wounds)
 Kidnapping
 Law Enforcement Victim
 Robbery
 Sexual Assault
 Miscellaneous (anything else that seems particularly exacerbating).

256. The Supreme Court has nicely summed up its doctrine on this point:

Our capital punishment cases under the Eighth Amendment address two different aspects of the capital decisionmaking process: the eligibility decision and the selection decision. To be eligible for the death penalty, the defendant must be convicted of a crime for which the death penalty is a proportionate punishment. To render a defendant eligible for the death penalty in a homicide case, we have indicated that the trier of fact must convict the defendant of murder and find one “aggravating circumstance” (or its equivalent) at either the guilt or penalty phase. . . . [T]he circumstance may not apply to every defendant convicted of a murder; it must apply only to a subclass of defendants convicted of murder.

Tuilaepa v. California, 512 U.S. 967, 971-72 (1994) (citations omitted).

257. South Carolina uses an aggravating circumstances scheme for determination of death eligibility. S.C. CODE ANN. § 16-3-20 (West Supp. 2000) (listing eleven aggravating circumstances, many of which have multiple permutations).

258. See, e.g., McCord, *supra* note 255, at 582-90 (analyzing twenty-five Georgia death-penalty cases and concluding that only one of them was even arguably overincluded); David McCord, *Is Death “Different” for Purposes of Harmless Error Analysis? Should It Be?: An Assessment of United States and Louisiana Supreme Court Caselaw*, 59 LA. L. REV. 1105, 1165-67 (1999) (analyzing all forty-four death penalty cases reviewed on direct appeal by the Louisiana Supreme Court during a six-year period). While the purpose of the article was not to report whether these cases seemed to contain recurring aggravating factors, my review indicated that each of them did. *Id.*

I then added up the depravity points for each case and ranked them from most to least depraved.

The incompleteness of the retrieved news reports provides some problems in this enterprise. Since I did not find news reports on approximately less than half the homicides, there is the possibility that there were some very bad homicides among that missing group. The SLED Report does provide information on some of the depravity points, even for cases which I did not find news articles, for example, information about additional victims and felonies.²⁵⁹ Thus, I can tell that there are six cases in which arrests were made about which I did not find news reports that might well qualify for being among the worst if I had further information: two double homicides, two rape/robberies, one burglary/robbery, and one arson/additional attempted murder.²⁶⁰

Still, the cases for which I did find news reports certainly provide a fair cross section of the homicides committed, including the three for which capital sentences were imposed.²⁶¹ Further, because the media is more likely to report a high-depravity point case due to its sensational nature, my sample contains a high proportion of the highly depraved homicides.

Another shortcoming in my analysis is the lack of information concerning the offenders' records for committing violent crimes. For many prosecutors, an offender's violent history is a significant, and sometimes determinative, factor in whether to seek a death sentence.²⁶² And it may also be a determinative factor to the sentencer. The only information about other acts of violence available in the news reports were those instances where other crimes of the offender were mentioned in the news reports of the other 1998 homicides that I was investigating.

Another shortcoming of my "depravity point" approach is that it accords each depravity point equal weight. In real life, though, for example, the killing of a law enforcement officer may have more weight than a burglary.²⁶³ Still, though, after seeing the results of my admittedly simplistic approach, I was satisfied that it did a good job on ranking the gravity of these homicides.

Finally, I could be faulted for ranking the crimes without considering key mitigating factors, such as the offender's youth, arguable insanity, or arguable mental retardation. Offenders with such characteristics may commit very

259. See SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

260. *Id.*

261. See *infra* Appendix H at no.2; Appendix L at no.12; Appendix R at nos.15-16.

262. See, e.g., Ronald J. Sievert, *Capital Murder: A Prosecutor's Personal Observations on the Prosecution of Capital Cases*, 27 AM. J. CRIM. L. 105, 108 (1999) ("For me, [a former death penalty prosecutor] the crime and the likely death of an innocent victim had to be contemplated in advance, and the history of the defendant had to be such that it was clear he or she was a truly dangerous (and evil) human being.").

263. See David C. Baldus et al., *Law and Statistics in Conflict: Reflections on McCleskey v. Kemp*, in RANDALL CAYNE & LYN ENTZEROTH, CAPITAL PUNISHMENT AND THE JUDICIAL PROCESS 147, 148 (1994) (recording the results of a sophisticated multiple regression analysis applied to this issue).

depraved crimes, yet the offender may not be among the worst murderers. Still, from the perspective of prosecutors, the characteristics of the crime, not the defects of the criminal, are primary in determining whether a death sentence will be sought.²⁶⁴

After assigning the depravity points in all the cases, I concluded that cases scoring between zero and two depravity points just did not look like the worst homicides in South Carolina during 1998. Instead, they looked like commonplace homicides that should not and did not provoke prosecutors to seek capital sentences.²⁶⁵ Thus, the following listing includes the twenty cases that garnered three or more depravity points.

1. *The Worst Homicides*

Ironically, I will be unable to include this highest depravity point case in my later analysis because the offenders were belatedly captured, and litigation is still pending as of the time of this writing (summer 2001). Thus, it is unknown whether some of the offenders will be sentenced to death.

a. *Nine (or Possibly More) Depravity Points*

Three offenders burglarized a Sam's Club store in Augusta, Georgia, after closing time as the manager was leaving.²⁶⁶ They forced him back into the store to open the safe, then forced him into the trunk of a car, drove the car across the river into North Augusta, South Carolina, and set the car on fire.²⁶⁷

One of the offenders had participated in an earlier burglary, robbery, and double homicide in Georgia.²⁶⁸ The depravity points for this offender are:

Depravity points: Burglary (2), Robbery (2), Kidnapping (1),
Arson (1), Horrendous method—burning
(1), Additional homicide (in Georgia) (2).

264. See Sievert, *supra* note 262, at 107-08.

265. The one possible two-depravity point case, which could have been an exception to this rule, is where the defendant shot his wife and the accompanying sheriff's deputy. See *infra* Appendix G at no.12; Appendix K at no.5. The killing of a law enforcement officer is particularly likely to induce a prosecutor to seek a death sentence. However, in this one instance in South Carolina during 1998 the printout indicates that the offender was dead and thus not amenable to a death sentence. SLED Report, *supra* note 6.

266. See *infra* Appendix R at no.18.

267. See *infra* Appendix R at no.18.

268. See *infra* Appendix R at no.18.

This offender might be ascribed even more depravity points, because he was part of a crime ring that was responsible for other serious felonies, including yet another double homicide in Georgia.²⁶⁹

The other two offenders garner five depravity points based on the Sam's Club homicide. Further, although they were not direct participants in the Georgia double homicide/burglary/robbery, they were part of the crime ring mentioned above.

<i>Race of offenders:</i>	B, B, B
<i>Race of victim:</i>	W (Sam's Club manager)
<i>Sentences:</i>	The offender with at least nine depravity points pleaded guilty to get a life sentence in exchange for testifying against the others. ²⁷⁰ The others, along with several other defendants, were (as of July, 2001) being prosecuted for wide-ranging crimes in Georgia under the state RICO statute. ²⁷¹ Presumably, South Carolina is standing in line to prosecute them for the Sam's Club murder.

b. Eight Depravity Points

Patti Syphrett offered Douglas Ferguson \$1000 to kill her daughter-in-law, Connie Snipes, and he apparently declined.²⁷² She then hired Sammie Stokes to kill Snipes, which he did after kidnapping and raping her.²⁷³ During and after the rape, Stokes mutilated Snipes with a knife and then shot her in the head.²⁷⁴ Then Syphrett and Stokes, worried that Ferguson would snitch on them, killed Ferguson by binding his head with duct tape and suffocating him.²⁷⁵ One other offender was deeply involved in the murder of Snipes, and yet another was marginally involved.²⁷⁶ Depravity points are calculated only for Syphrett and Stokes.

269. See Sandy Hodson, *Six Enter Not-Guilty Pleas on Racketeering Charges*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 13, 2001, at A1; Sandy Hodson, *RICO Law Expert Explains its Terms*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 5, 2001, at B9; Johnny Edwards, *3 Arrested; 1 worked at Sam's Club*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Mar. 31, 2001, at A1.

270. See *infra* Appendix R at no.18.

271. See *infra* Appendix R at no.18.

272. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

273. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

274. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

275. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

276. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

<i>Depravity Points:</i>	Additional murder, Clear premeditation (2), Sexual assault, Kidnaping, Horrendous method (2), Multiple stabbing and gunshot, Suffocation, Miscellaneous murder-for-hire
<i>Race of offenders:</i>	W (female), B (male), B (female), unknown as to fourth offender
<i>Race of victims:</i>	W, W
<i>Sentences:</i>	The prosecution sought the death sentence against the white, female offender, but the jury returned a life sentence after only an hour's deliberation. ²⁷⁷ The black male offender was sentenced to death in a separate trial, which was not reported in news articles, but discovered while searching the list of South Carolina death row inmates. ²⁷⁸ There were no news reports about sentences for the other two offenders, but reports indicated that the prosecution intended to seek the death sentence against the remaining male offender, but not against the black female offender. ²⁷⁹ The remaining male offender is not on the list of convicts on South Carolina's death row, so apparently he escaped a death sentence. ²⁸⁰

c. *Six Depravity Points*

Six masked men broke into a house, forced the five occupants to lie down, and shot all of them; two survived.²⁸¹ The incident was suspected to be drug-related.²⁸²

<i>Depravity points:</i>	Clear premeditation (1), Burglary (1), Additional murder (2), and Additional attempted murder (2).
--------------------------	--

277. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

278. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

279. See *infra* Appendix R at nos.15-16.

280. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

281. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.7-9.

282. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.7-9.

Race of offenders: B, B, B²⁸³
Race of victims: B, B, B
Sentences: Two convicted and sentenced to 60 years;
 three of the four others pleaded guilty to
 lesser charges; outcome for other
 unknown.²⁸⁴

d. Five Depravity Points

Offender drowned a child relative, then a few days later asphyxiated the first victim's younger brother.²⁸⁵

Depravity points: Additional murder (1), Child victim (2),
 Horrendous method—drowning (1), and
 Horrendous method—asphyxiation (1).
Race of offender: B
Race of victims: B, B
Sentence: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.
 Offender was only seventeen.²⁸⁶

e. Four Depravity Points

1. Offender entered victim's workplace, set fire to the office, robbed and kidnapped the victim, and beat victim with a pipe.²⁸⁷ The victim died twelve days later from the beating.²⁸⁸

Depravity points: Arson (1), Robbery (1), Kidnapping (1),
 and Horrendous method—beating with pipe
 (1).
Race of offender: B²⁸⁹
Race of victim: W
Sentence: Plea bargain to life sentence.²⁹⁰

283. Since this case was not reported in the SLED Report, I had to resort to other means to find the race of the offenders and victims. Telephone Interview with Timothy H. Pogue, Marion County Attorney (July 1, 2001).

284. *See infra* Appendix Q at nos.7-9.

285. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.10-11.

286. *See infra* Appendix L at nos.10-11.

287. *See infra* Appendix R at no.1.

288. *See infra* Appendix R at no.1.

289. Since this case was not reported in the SLED Report, I had to resort to other means to find the race of the offender and the victim. Telephone interview with Kristy Repon, Reporter, *The Chronicle Independent*, in Camden, S.C. (July 5, 2001).

290. *See infra* Appendix R at no.1.

2. Offender, who was the boyfriend of victim's mother, sexually abused and asphyxiated the victim while the mother was away.²⁹¹

Depravity points: Child victim (1), Sexual assault (1), Clear premeditation (1), and Horrendous method—asphyxiation (1).
Race of offender: W
Race of victim: W
Sentence: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.²⁹²

3. Four persons stole a pound of marijuana from one offender; one individual ran away with it.²⁹³ Offender shot two of the remaining three marijuana thieves and then called two of his friends for help.²⁹⁴ These other two offenders took the third marijuana thief into the countryside and shot him numerous times.²⁹⁵

Depravity points: Kidnapping (1), Additional murder (2), Horrendous method—multiple shots (1).
Race of offenders: W, W, W
Race of victims: B, B, B
Sentences: Two received life-without-parole sentences; the other received a two-year term as an accessory after the fact.²⁹⁶

4. Offender broke into the home of her boyfriend, who was the father of a two-year-old, fought with the man, and started a fire that killed the two-year-old victim.²⁹⁷

Depravity points: Burglary (1), Arson (1), Child victim (1) and Horrendous method—burning (1).
Race of offender: B
Race of victim: B
Sentence: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.²⁹⁸

291. See *infra* Appendix L at no.4.

292. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

293. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4.

294. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4.

295. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4.

296. See *infra* Appendix Q at nos.2-4.

297. See *infra* Appendix L at no.5.

298. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

5. Offender ex-husband broke into ex-wife's house, shot her several times with a shotgun, and later told the police that he enjoyed it.²⁹⁹

Depravity points: Clear premeditation (1), Burglary (1),
Horrendous method—multiple shots (1),
Miscellaneous—relished murder (1).
Race of offender: W
Race of victim: W
Sentence: Death³⁰⁰

6. Three offenders robbed a drug house and shot an occupant.³⁰¹ Weeks later, the same offenders carjacked and repeatedly shot a victim, who had stopped to help them when their car broke down.³⁰²

Depravity points: Robbery (of drug house) (1), Additional
murder (1), Robbery (carjacking) (1),
Horrendous method—multiple shots (1).
Race of offenders: B, B, B
Race of victims: B, B
Sentences: One offender pleaded to voluntary
manslaughter and agreed to testify against
the other two.³⁰³ Unknown as to other two,
but no death sentences were imposed.³⁰⁴

7. The offenders, mother and father of an infant less than a year old, sexually abused the infant for two months before conspiring to kill him for fear doctors would discover the abuse on the next visit.³⁰⁵ The father smothered the victim with a pillow.³⁰⁶

Depravity points: Sexual assault (1), Clear premeditation (1),
Child victim (1), Horrendous
method—smothering (1).
Race of offenders: W, W
Race of victim: W
Sentences: The prosecution filed notice of intent to
seek the death penalty against the father,

299. *See infra* Appendix H at no.2.

300. *See infra* Appendix H at no.2.

301. *See infra* Appendix Q at no.6.

302. *See infra* Appendix Q at no.6; Appendix R at no.17.

303. *See infra* Appendix Q at no.6; Appendix R at no.17.

304. *See* DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

305. *See infra* Appendix L at no.6.

306. *See infra* Appendix L at no.6.

who plea bargained to a life sentence; a death notice was not filed as to the wife, who also plea bargained to a life sentence.³⁰⁷

8. Offender father poured gasoline around a van in which his two-year-old daughter was sitting, got in, left a suicide note, and set the van afire as revenge against his estranged wife.³⁰⁸ But the offender escaped the burning van, suffering serious burns in the process.³⁰⁹

Depravity points: Arson (1), Child victim (1), Horrendous method—burning (1), Clear premeditation (1)
Race of offender: W
Race of victim: W
Sentence: Offender pleaded guilty, against advice of counsel, and was sentenced to death by a judge.³¹⁰

f. Three Depravity Points

1. Offender raped victim in the bushes, beat her beyond recognition, and strangled her.³¹¹ Although offender was not prosecuted for kidnapping, there is a strong implication of kidnapping or at least wrongful imprisonment.³¹²

Depravity points: Sexual assault (1), Kidnap (or at least wrongful imprisonment) (1), Horrendous method—beating and strangulation (1)
Race of offender: B
Race of victim: W
Sentence: Thirty years for voluntary manslaughter after conviction by jury.³¹³

2. Three offenders burglarized and robbed a residence and shot the occupant multiple times.³¹⁴

³⁰⁷. See *infra* Appendix L at no.6.

³⁰⁸. See *infra* Appendix L at no.12.

³⁰⁹. See *infra* Appendix L at no.12.

³¹⁰. See *infra* Appendix L at no.12.

³¹¹. See *infra* Appendix R at no.4.

³¹². See *infra* Appendix R at no.4.

³¹³. See *infra* Appendix R at no.4.

³¹⁴. See *infra* Appendix R at no.5.

Depravity points: Burglary (1), Robbery (1), Horrendous method—multiple shots (1)
Race of offenders: B, B, B
Race of victim: B
Sentences: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.³¹⁵

3. High school student carjacked by three offenders, one of whom shot him multiple times; the shooter had been planning a carjacking for some time.³¹⁶

Depravity points: Robbery (1), Horrendous method—multiple shots (1), Clear premeditation (at least by shooter) (1)
Race of offenders: B, B, B
Race of victim: B
Sentences: Two offenders: one offender got a life sentence; the other offender got a forty-two year sentence.³¹⁷

4. Offender kicked in the door of an apartment to commit robbery and shot both occupants, one of whom survived.³¹⁸

Depravity points: Burglary (1), Robbery (1), Additional attempted murder (1)
Race of offender: B
Race of victim: B
Sentence: Thirty years for voluntary manslaughter.³¹⁹

5. Three offenders robbed, kidnapped, and strangled victim.³²⁰

Depravity points: Robbery (1), Kidnapping (1), Horrendous method—strangulation (1)
Race of offenders: W, W, W
Race of victim: W
Sentences: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.³²¹

315. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

316. See *infra* Appendix R at no.11.

317. See *infra* Appendix R at no.11.

318. See *infra* Appendix R at no.20.

319. See *infra* Appendix R at no.20.

320. See *infra* Appendix R at no.22.

321. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

6. Offender son burglarized his mother's house, stole her money and car keys, and hit her in the head two or three times with a hammer.³²²

Depravity points: Burglary (1), Robbery (1), Horrendous method—blunt instrument (1)
Race of offender: B
Race of victim: B
Sentence: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.³²³

7. Offender raped, robbed, and drowned victim in her home.³²⁴ Offender was also convicted of kidnapping, but according to news reports the criminal episode all took place within her home,³²⁵ so the kidnapping conviction must have been based on a theory—which wisely has been abandoned in most jurisdictions—that forced movement of a person a short distance within a building is sufficient to satisfy the “asportation” requirement.³²⁶ In my opinion, this episode did not seem to involve a “real” kidnapping, so I did not ascribe a depravity point for it.

Depravity points: Sexual assault (1), Robbery (1), Horrendous method—drowning (1)
Race of offender: B
Race of victim: B
Sentence: Life without parole.³²⁷

8. Offender burgled victim's house to commit robbery, kidnapped the victim and shot him about a quarter-mile away from his home.³²⁸

Depravity points: Burglary (1), Robbery (1), Kidnapping (1)
Race of offender: B
Race of victim: B
Sentence: Unknown, but there was no death sentence.³²⁹

322. See *infra* Appendix R at no.23.

323. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

324. See *infra* Appendix R at no.29.

325. See *infra* Appendix R at no.29.

326. S.C. CODE ANN. § 16-3-910 (West Supp. 2000) (outlining kidnapping elements); State v. Jeffries, 316 S.C. 13, 23 n.12, 446 S.E.2d 427, 433 n.12 (1994).

327. See *infra* Appendix R at no.29.

328. See *infra* Appendix Q at no.14.

329. See DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

C. *Overinclusion Examined*

Without doubt, the three cases in which death sentences were imposed in South Carolina during 1998 were among the worst homicides. One of the cases involved eight depravity points; thus, it was the worst case of the year (excluding the nine depravity point case from consideration because it is still pending).³³⁰ The other two cases each garnered four depravity points, which puts them among the twelve worst cases in South Carolina during 1998.³³¹

The only possibility of overinclusion arises in the one of the three cases involving multiple offenders, since it is always possible that an offender who gets a death sentence in a multiple offender scenario should not be attributed all aspects of the crime that make it among the worst.³³²

D. *Underinclusion Examined*

Just as clear as the fact that overinclusion did not exist is the fact that underinclusion did. Excluding the single most aggravated case from consideration because it has yet to be litigated,³³³ the eleven remaining cases scoring four or more in depravity points included a total of twenty-one offenders.³³⁴ Of these offenders, only three received death sentences and considering the number of cases rather than the number of offenders, death sentences were only handed out in three of the eleven cases with four or more depravity points.³³⁵ Further, no death sentences were meted out to any of the fifteen offenders in the nine cases scoring three depravity points.³³⁶

Whether underinclusion is a problem is in the eye of the beholder. Death penalty opponents argue, somewhat disingenuously in my mind because they do not really want to see this problem cured by *more* death sentences, that since there are equally culpable offenders who do not receive death sentences this makes it unfair to the ones who do.³³⁷ Death penalty supporters argue that while in a perfect world all of these equally culpable and very heinous offenders would receive death sentences, in this imperfect world it is still better justice

330. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-b.

331. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.e.5 & Part IV.B.1.e.8.

332. *See* David McCord, *State Death Sentencing for Felony Murder Accomplices Under the Enmund and Tison Standards*, 32 ARIZ. ST. L.J. 843, 867-70 (2000) (detailing reasons why less depraved co-felons may nonetheless have the highest level of depravity projected upon them).

333. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a.

334. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

335. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

336. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.f.

337. *See, e.g.*, Marvin E. Wolfgang, *We Do Not Deserve to Kill*, 13 T. M. COOLEY L. REV. 977, 985-87 (1996) (arguing in Socratic dialogue form that inequality of application among even "deserving" offenders makes the death penalty an intolerable sanction).

for a few of those who deserve death to receive it.³³⁸ Thus, the fact that sometimes prosecutors must make strategic choices, such as accepting a plea bargain in a case where proof of guilt is less than ironclad, or giving a deal to one offender to get his testimony against another, does not undermine the validity of death sentences on those who deserve them.³³⁹

E. Did Race-of-Defendant Discrimination Exist?

There is no evident racial discrimination on the basis of the defendant's race from my data. Two of the offenders who received death sentences were white, one was black,³⁴⁰ which is almost exactly the same proportion of whites to blacks in the South Carolina population.³⁴¹ Indeed, given that blacks constituted eleven of the twenty offenders involved in the cases scoring four or higher in depravity points, excluding the pending case,³⁴² it appears that blacks may, in fact, have been *under*-represented among capital sentenced defendants. This, of course, is what one would expect if there are victim race effects, given that most homicides are intraracial. I will examine this proposition shortly.

The only possible evidence of defendant race discrimination is in the multiple offender case scoring eight depravity points.³⁴³ The prosecution sought the death penalty against the white female offender, but the jury declined to impose it; while in a later trial, the jury did impose a death sentence on the black male defendant.³⁴⁴

Also, one might wish to examine whether black defendants are more likely to receive death sentences when they kill white victims. There were so few

338. See, e.g., Ernst van den Haag, *In Defense of the Death Penalty: A Practical and Moral Analysis*, in *THE DEATH PENALTY IN AMERICA* 323, 323-24 (Hugo Adam Bedau ed., 3d ed. 1982):

Justice requires punishing the guilty—as many of the guilty as possible—even if only some can be punished, and sparing the innocent—as many of the innocent as possible, even if not all are spared. Morally, justice must always be preferred to equality. It would surely be wrong to treat everybody with equal injustice in preference to meting out justice to some. Justice cannot ever permit sparing some guilty persons, or punishing some innocent ones, for the sake of equality—because others have been unjustly spared or punished. . . . Anyone familiar with law enforcement knows that punishments can be inflicted only on an unavoidably capricious selection of the guilty.

339. See Barry Latzer, *The Failure of Comparative Proportionality Review of Capital Cases (With Lessons from New Jersey)*, 64 ALB. L. REV. 1161, 1235-43 (2001) (arguing that underinclusion is inevitable in the real world due to problems of proof and exigencies such as budgets and plea bargains for testimony and that underinclusion for these reasons does not undermine the legitimacy of capital punishment).

340. See *supra* Part IV.B.

341. See *supra* notes 78-80 and accompanying text.

342. See *supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

343. See *supra* Part IV.B.1.b.

344. See *supra* Part IV.B.1.b.

interracial killings among the homicides scoring three or more depravity points that it is difficult to tell whether there is any basis for this fear. Only four white victims were killed by black offenders among these cases: two in the six depravity point case where a mixed race group of offenders killed two white victims,³⁴⁵ one in a four depravity point case of robbery, kidnap, and arson,³⁴⁶ and one in a three depravity point case where a black male offender killed a white female victim.³⁴⁷ A death sentence was imposed against one of the two black offenders in the eight depravity point case, but not on the other.³⁴⁸ Also, the death sentence was not imposed in the four depravity point³⁴⁹ nor the three depravity point cases.³⁵⁰

F. Victim Race Effects

Victim race effects are quite apparent from my data. Excluding the unresolved, nine-depravity-point case, there were eighteen victims in the eleven cases scoring four or more depravity points.³⁵¹ Eleven of those victims were black and seven white.³⁵² Yet all three death sentences were assessed to killers of white victims; if the nine-depravity-point case results in death sentences, those too will be for a white victim.³⁵³ Broadening the scope to include cases scoring three depravity points, there were twenty-six victims—seventeen black and nine white.³⁵⁴ Still, the only three death sentences were proscribed for the murders of white victims.³⁵⁵ Even more broadly, recall that I did not find news reports³⁵⁶ on approximately 150 homicides—undoubtedly, some of those homicides would involve black victims in high depravity point cases. Yet no death sentences arose from the case segment about which I did not find reports.³⁵⁷

Of course, this pattern does not necessarily indicate that racial discrimination was occurring. More particular facts of the cases may justify the differential treatments. Still though, this finding is quite consistent with other

345. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.c.

346. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.e.1.

347. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.f.1.

348. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.b.

349. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.e.1.

350. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.f.1.

351. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

352. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

353. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

354. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-f.

355. *See supra* Part IV.B.1.a-e.

356. *See supra* Part IV.A.

357. *See* DEATH PENALTY INFO. CTR., *supra* note 9, at <http://www.deathpenaltyinfo.org/DRUSA-SC.html> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002).

studies that have concluded there are significant victim race effects in death sentencing, whether or not this is intended by prosecutors and sentencers.³⁵⁸

V. CONCLUSION

A reader may well ask concerning all this data, "Is it any more than merely interesting? Is it in some way useful? In particular, does it tell us anything about how to decrease the number of homicides?" Obviously, simply knowing as much as we can about homicides does not, in and of itself, aid in their prevention. However, acquiring such knowledge is a necessary preliminary step in designing public policies to prevent homicides. Several desirable public policy steps are easily inferable from my data—all are unsurprising and difficult to implement: (1) reduce the availability of firearms,³⁵⁹ (2) provide better economic opportunities for the poor, (3) teach non-violent dispute-resolution techniques among people who know each other, (4) provide better police and community protection to those who face domestic danger, and (5) make illegal drug trafficking less of a high-stakes game.

As to my capital punishment data, I urge more persons concerned about the death penalty—both supporters and opponents—to undertake the kind of detailed, nitty-gritty analysis I have attempted, rather than relying on unproven generalizations such as, "The death penalty is imposed only on the worst-of-the-worst," or, to the contrary, "The death penalty is applied on an arbitrary basis."³⁶⁰ Truly, the death penalty devil is in the details.

358. The most famous such study is the one conducted by University of Iowa researchers which led to an almost successful challenge to the death penalty in *McCleskey v. Kemp*, 481 U.S. 279, 291-99 (1987), on the basis of racial bias. See Baldus et al., *supra* note 263. That sophisticated multiple regression analysis, based upon thousands of Georgia homicide cases over many years, found that the factor of "one or more white victims" injected into the case a "death-odds multiplier" of 4.3, that is, that "on the average, after adjustment for the other factors in the model, a defendant's odds of receiving a death sentence are increased by a factor of 4.3 when the victim is white." *Id.* at 148-49.

359. But see Daniel D. Polsby & Don B. Kates, Jr., *American Homicide Exceptionalism*, 69 U. COLO. L. REV. 969, 992-1007 (1998) (arguing that most homicides are committed by persons with histories of criminal violence, and there is no evidence that these persons would find it difficult to obtain a gun even if firearms were much less readily available).

360. For example, death penalty opponents often promulgate what I will call the "friendless drifter" prototype of condemned inmates and assert that many, if not most, death-sentenced inmates fit the following pattern: a young, poor, urban male who is black or Latino, a newcomer to a rural or small-town area having a criminal record, and who has killed a merchant or law enforcement officer during the course of some serious felony. See James S. Liebman, *The Overproduction of Death*, 100 COLUM. L. REV. 2030, 2078 (2000) (characterizing this as "a generalized fact pattern often encountered in capital cases"). I have never seen any detailed analysis performed that would substantiate this prototype. Certainly, the 1998 South Carolina data does not support this prototype—two of the three death-sentenced inmates committed domestic homicides, and the third, as far as I could tell from the sparse available data, was not a drifter. Further, I have read hundreds of appellate opinions during several years of death penalty research, and I have not found the "friendless drifter" scenario to be particularly common.

*

APPENDIX A
COMPARISON OF POPULATION AND HOMICIDE RATE

County	Population (rounded to nearest hundred from 2000 Census data) ³⁶¹	Number of Homicides ³⁶²	Homicide Rate per 100,000 (rounded to nearest tenth)
Greenville	379,600	24	6.3
Richland	320,700	27	8.4
Charleston	310,000	16	5.2
Spartanburg	253,800	25	9.9
Lexington	216,000	10	4.6
Horry	196,600	15	7.6
Anderson	165,700	10	6.0
York	164,600	10	6.1
Berkeley	142,700	7	4.9
Aiken	142,600	12	8.4
Florence	125,800	7	5.6
Beaufort	120,900	7	5.8
Pickens	110,800	5	4.5
Sumter	104,700	9	8.6
Dorchester	96,400	3	3.1
Orangeburg	91,600	18	19.7
Laurens	69,600	6	8.6
Darlington	67,400	4	5.9
Greenwood	66,300	4	6.0

361. See CENSUS 2000, *supra* note 5, at <http://www.census.gov/population/cen2000/phc-t4/tab02.pdf> (last visited Jan. 23, 2002) (listing counties by state).

362. See SLED Report, *supra* note 6. I found twelve homicides through news reports that were not reported in the SLED Report. I ignored these for purposes of calculating the figures in Part I of this Article, with one exception: that was a triple homicide in Marion County doubling the homicide rate in that relatively small county. The adjusted figures are in parentheses. The other nine non-reported homicides were scattered across other counties, where their inclusion would not so dramatically effect the homicide rates.

County	Population (rounded to nearest hundred from 2000 Census data)	Number of Homicides	Homicide Rate per 100,000 (rounded to nearest tenth)
Oconee	66,200	1	1.5
Lancaster	61,400	3	4.9
Georgetown	55,800	4	7.2
Cherokee	52,500	5	9.5
Kershaw	52,600	3	5.7
Chesterfield	42,800	7	16.4
Colleton	38,300	6	15.7
Williamsburg	37,200	4	10.8
Newberry	36,100	4	11.1
Marion	35,500	3 (6)	8.4 (16.9)
Chester	34,100	2	5.9
Clarendon	32,500	3	9.2
Dillon	30,700	9	29.3
Union	29,900	1	3.3
Marlboro	28,800	11	38.2
Abbeville	26,200	3	11.5
Edgefield	24,600	2	8.1
Barnwell	23,500	0	0.0
Fairfield	23,500	1	4.3
Hampton	21,400	2	9.3
Jasper	20,700	5	24.2
Lee	20,100	1	5.0
Saluda	19,200	3	15.6
Bamberg	16,700	2	12.0
Calhoun	15,200	1	6.6
Allendale	11,200	0	0.0
McCormick	10,000	0	0.0
TOTAL	4,016,500	305	7.6 ³⁶³

363. This is lower than the 8.0 figure reported in the *Sourcebook*, undoubtedly because the *Sourcebook* compilers did not have access to the 2000 Census figures on which I based my population figures. See SOURCEBOOK, *supra* note 4, at 279.

APPENDIX B**COMPARISON OF POPULATION DENSITY AND HOMICIDE RATE**

County	Population Density (2000 Census Data) ³⁶⁴	Homicide Rate per 100,000 ³⁶⁵
Greenville	480.5	6.3
Richland	424.2	8.4
Charleston	337.3	5.2
Spartanburg	312.9	9.9
Lexington	309.0	4.6
York	241.4	6.1
Anderson	230.8	6.0
Pickens	222.9	4.5
Beaufort	206.0	5.8
Horry	173.4	7.6
Dorchester	167.7	3.1
Sumter	157.4	8.6
Florence	157.2	5.6
Greenwood	145.3	6.0
Cherokee	133.7	9.5
Aiken	132.9	8.4
Berkeley	129.9	4.9
Darlington	120.1	5.9
Lancaster	111.8	4.9
Oconee	105.9	1.5
Laurens	97.3	8.6
Orangeburg	82.8	19.7
Dillon	75.9	29.3
Kershaw	72.5	5.7

364. See CENSUS 2000, *supra* note 5, at <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/45000.html> (last visited Jan. 24, 2002).

365. See *supra* Appendix A.

County	Population Density (2000 Census Data)	Homicide Rate per 100,000
Marion	72.5	8.4 (16.9) ³⁶⁶
Georgetown	68.5	7.2
Marlboro	60.0	38.2
Chester	58.6	5.9
Union	58.1	3.3
Newberry	57.2	11.1
Chesterfield	53.5	16.4
Clarendon	53.5	9.2
Abbeville	51.5	11.5
Lee	49.1	5.0
Edgefield	49.0	8.1
Barnwell	42.8	0
Bamberg	42.4	12.0
Saluda	42.4	15.6
Calhoun	40.0	6.6
Williamsburg	39.8	10.8
Hampton	38.2	9.3
Colleton	36.2	15.7
Fairfield	34.1	4.3
Jasper	31.5	24.2
McCormick	27.7	0
Allendale	27.5	0

366. The 16.9 figure includes a triple homicide not included in the SLED Report.

APPENDIX C

HOMICIDE RATES BY COUNTY



APPENDIX D
COMPARISON OF MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME AND HOMICIDE
RATE

County	Median Household Income (rounded to nearest hundred \$) ³⁶⁷	Homicide Rate ³⁶⁸
Lexington	42,700	4.6
York	39,700	6.1
Beaufort	38,900	5.8
Greenville	38,800	6.3
Aiken	38,100	8.4
Dorchester	36,600	3.1
Berkeley	36,200	4.9
Richland	35,900	8.4
Pickens	35,800	4.5
Spartanburg	35,700	9.9
Charleston	35,200	5.2
Anderson	34,700	6.0
Oconee	34,300	1.5
Kershaw	34,100	5.7
Greenwood	32,900	6.0
Lancaster	32,700	4.9
Cherokee	31,500	9.5
Horry	31,300	7.6
Abbeville	31,000	11.5
Georgetown	30,900	7.2
Florence	30,600	5.6
Newberry	30,600	11.1
Laurens	30,200	8.6

367. See CENSUS 1997, *supra* note 5, at http://www.census.gov/hhes/www/saiper/stcty/c97_45.htm (last visited Jan. 24, 2002).

368. See *supra* Appendix A.

County	Median Household Income (rounded to nearest hundred \$)	Homicide Rate
Calhoun	29,500	6.6
Barnwell	29,100	0
Chester	29,100	5.9
Edgefield	29,000	8.1
Saluda	29,000	15.6
Sumter	29,000	8.6
Union	28,700	3.3
Darlington	28,600	5.9
Chesterfield	28,400	16.4
Fairfield	27,800	4.3
McCormick	27,100	0
Orangeburg	26,600	19.7
Colleton	25,700	15.7
Jasper	25,200	24.2
Hampton	25,100	9.3
Bamberg	23,900	12.0
Clarendon	23,900	9.2
Dillon	23,600	29.3
Marlboro	23,500	38.2
Marion	23,300	8.4 (16.9) ³⁶⁹
Lee	23,200	5.0
Williamsburg	22,400	10.8
Allendale	20,900	0

369. The 16.9 figure includes a triple homicide not reported in the SLED Report.

APPENDIX E
COMPARISON OF POVERTY RATE AND HOMICIDE RATE

County	Poverty Rate (1997 data) ³⁷⁰	Homicide Rate ³⁷¹
Allendale	35.1	0
Lee	28.3	5.0
Williamsburg	28.3	10.8
Clarendon	26.8	9.2
Bamberg	26.4	12.0
Dillon	25.7	29.3
Jasper	25.5	24.2
Marion	24.1	8.4 (16.9) ³⁷²
Hampton	23.9	9.3
Orangeburg	23.3	19.7
Marlboro	23.2	38.2
Colleton	22.6	15.7
Barnwell	21.5	0
Darlington	20.2	5.9
Sumter	19.7	8.6
McCormick	19.6	0
Fairfield	19.5	4.3
Florence	19.4	5.6
Calhoun	19.2	6.6
Edgefield	18.8	8.1
Chesterfield	18.8	16.4
Georgetown	18.6	7.2
Chester	17.2	5.9
Charleston	16.8	5.2
Saluda	16.8	15.6
Lancaster	14.8	4.9

370. See CENSUS 1997, *supra* note 5, at http://www.census.gov/hhes/www/saiper/stcty/a97_45.htm (last visited Jan. 27, 2002).

371. See *supra* Appendix A.

372. The 16.9 figure includes a triple homicide not reported in the SLED Report.

2002]

APPENDICES

307

County	Poverty Rate (1997 data)	Homicide Rate
Richland	14.8	8.4
Horry	14.4	7.6
Newberry	14.4	11.1
Laurens	14.3	8.6
Union	14.2	3.3
Abbeville	14.1	11.5
Berkeley	14.1	4.9
Cherokee	14.1	9.5
Greenwood	13.8	6.0
Aiken	13.7	8.4
Dorchester	13.1	3.1
Beaufort	13.0	5.8
Kershaw	12.4	5.7
Spartanburg	11.6	9.9
Oconee	11.1	1.5
Pickens	11.1	4.5
York	11.0	6.1
Anderson	10.8	6.0
Greenville	10.5	6.3
Lexington	9.4	4.6

APPENDIX F
COMPARISON OF BLACK POPULATION PERCENTAGE WITH HOMICIDE
RATE

County	Black Population Percentage ³⁷³	Homicide Rate ³⁷⁴
Allendale	71	0
Williamsburg	66	10.8
Lee	64	5.0
Bamberg	63	12.0
Orangeburg	61	19.7
Fairfield	59	4.3
Marion	56	8.4 (16.9) ³⁷⁵
Hampton	56	9.3
McCormick	54	0
Clarendon	53	9.2
Jasper	53	24.1
Marlboro	51	38.2
Calhoun	49	6.6
Sumter	47	8.6
Dillon	45	29.3
Richland	45	8.4
Barnwell	43	0
Colleton	42	15.7
Darlington	42	5.9
Edgefield	42	8.1

373. CENSUS2000, *supra* note 5, at <http://www.census.gov/population/cen2000/phc-t14/tab06.pdf> (last visited Jan. 24, 2002).

374. See *supra* Appendix A.

375. The 16.9 figure includes a triple homicide not reported in the SLED Report.

County	Black Population Percentage	Homicide Rate
Chester	39	5.9
Florence	39	5.6
Georgetown	39	7.2
Charleston	35	5.2
Chesterfield	33	16.4
Newberry	33	11.1
Greenwood	32	6.0
Union	31	3.3
Abbeville	30	11.5
Saluda	30	15.6
Berkeley	27	4.9
Lancaster	27	4.9
Aiken	26	8.4
Kershaw	26	5.7
Laurens	26	8.6
Dorchester	25	3.1
Beaufort	24	5.8
Cherokee	21	9.5
Spartanburg	21	9.9
York	19	6.1
Greenville	18	6.3
Anderson	17	6.0
Horry	16	7.6
Lexington	13	4.6
Oconee	8	1.5
Pickens	7	4.5

APPENDIX G³⁷⁶

DOMESTIC—MALE/FEMALE RELATIONSHIP—SPONTANEOUS

1. March 21; York County

Offender estranged husband asked his victim wife to come to his apartment to give him money to leave town. She arrived with a man. Offender inquired about her relationship with the man, and she replied that she loved him. Offender, who had been drinking, emptied a revolver into victim's chest, and shot the man with a shotgun. The man survived. Kenneth A. Gaillard, *Wife, 19, Dies in Shooting*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 23, 1998, at 1A; Melissa Inzerillo, *Man Suspected in Wife's Slaying Waives Hearing*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), May. 1, 1998, at 1B; *Local Briefs*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 24, 1998, at 8A; *Man Faces Charges in Wife's Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 24, 1998, at B3; *Rock Hill Man, 20, Gets Life for Killing Estranged Wife*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 12, 1998, at B2; Andrew J. Skerrett, *Man to Serve 2 Life Sentences*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 11, 1998, at 1A.

2. March 30; Pickens County

Live-in boyfriend shot girlfriend in the face after an evening of arguing; she had told him to move out. *Man Gets 48 Years for Killing Girlfriend*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 5, 1998, at B3; *Man Sentenced to 48 Years for Killing Girlfriend*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 5, 1998, at 4B; *Man Who Killed Girlfriend Given 48 Years in Jail*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 5, 1998, at B2; *Pickens County Woman, 22, Shot, Killed at Norris Home*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 31, 1998, at B2; *Pickens Man Charged In Roommate's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 31, 1998, at B3.

3. April 26; Newberry County

After an argument, husband shot wife in their home; at least two of their four children witnessed the murder. John Allard, *Man Charged in Wife's Murder*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 27, 1998, at B3; *Man Charged in Wife's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 27, 1998, at B4.

376. The homicides are in chronological order within each Appendix.

4. May 13; Greenwood County

Girlfriend shot boyfriend in the chest at his home. *Seneca Couple Charged in Shooting of Greenwood Man*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 18, 1998, at B3.

5. May 29; Abbeville County

Husband shot his wife of forty years during an argument at the home of their daughter; the couple had been separated for six years. *Honea Path Man Charged in Estranged Wife's Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 2, 1998, at B2.

6. June 15; Lexington County

Husband shot wife in the head in their home. *Jury to Begin Hearing Gregory Trial Today*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 17, 2000, at B3; *Man Sentenced to Life in Prison for Murder of His Wife*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 26, 2000, at Neighbors 6-3; *Testimony Begins in Gregory Trial*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 18, 2000, at B3; *West Columbia Man Held After Death of Wife*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 17, 1998, at B3.

7. July 9; Lexington County

Girlfriend had moved out of apartment of offender, and had gone back with a friend to retrieve children and possessions when the offender shot her in the car and wounded her friend. *Woman Shot Dead at Apartment Complex*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 10, 1998, at B6.

8. July 13; Horry County

Offender girlfriend shot victim boyfriend during a domestic dispute. Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

9. July 25; Marion County

Victim boyfriend argued with offender girlfriend and slapped her around; then he went to sleep. She shot him with a shotgun while he slept. She and her father buried the body, which was not discovered for several months. *Body Found in Shallow Grave in Horry County*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 25, 1998, at C3. This homicide was not reported in SLED Report.

10. January 13; Georgetown County

Offender boyfriend killed victim girlfriend by blunt face trauma for unknown reasons. Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

11. August 23; York County

"Offender" girlfriend was cornered by "victim" boyfriend during a drunken rage, and she stabbed him. "Offender" and "victim" are in quotation marks because she was acquitted by a jury. Jeffrey Collins, *Rock Hill Woman Found Innocent in Stabbing Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), June 24, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Trial Begins for Woman Charged with Stabbing Boyfriend*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), June 22, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Family: Woman's Bond Set Too Low*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 28, 1998, at 1B; Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Woman Charged in Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 25, 1998, at 1A.

12. August 31; Chesterfield County

One victim, a sheriff's deputy, accompanied the other victim, the offender's wife, to her home pursuant to a court order to pick up her personal belongings. Offender shot both. Wife's death is the subject of the entry in this Appendix; deputy's death is listed in Appendix K. James R. Langford & Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Deputy, Woman Killed*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 1, 1998, at 1A; Elsa McDowell, *Police Death Sends Chills in Community*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 23, 1999, at B1.

13. September 5; Anderson County

Live-in girlfriend shot her boyfriend in the thigh during an argument. The boyfriend locked himself in the bathroom and bled to death even though the wound would not have been fatal with treatment. *Court TV to Show Belton Woman's Trial*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 19, 1999, at B3; *Simpsonville Man Shot to Death; Woman Arrested*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 7, 1998, at B3.

14. September 18; Pickens County

Husband choked wife during an argument in their home. *Central Man Charged with Choking Wife*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 21, 1998, at B3.

15. September 24; Lexington County

Offender husband and victim wife argued. Then he beat her and strangled her. John Allard, *Man Who Beat, Strangled Wife Sentenced to Life*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 29, 1999, at B3; John Allard, *Murder Trial Outcome is up to Judge*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 28, 1999, at B3; *Autopsy Says Strangulation was Cause of Woman's Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 26, 1998, at B3; *West Columbia Man Charged with Wife's Death; He Called 911*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 25, 1998, at B3.

16. September 27; Saluda County

Wife, in common law marriage, stabbed her husband during a dispute. *Saluda County Man Fatally Stabbed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 29, 1998, at B3; *Saluda Woman Charged With Killing Common-law Husband*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 29, 1998, at B2.

17. October 1; Charleston County

Offender, a common law wife, shot victim, her common law husband, at their home. Edward C. Fennell & Richard Green, Jr., *Record Low Tri-County Murders in 1998; Half of All Victims Were Black Men*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 17, 1999, at A1.

18. October 19; Berkeley County

Husband shot and killed his wife during an argument in their home. During the 911 call he claimed she had committed suicide. Mark Hyler, *Man Given Life in Wife's Murder*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 27, 1999, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Murder Trial Testimony Concludes*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 26, 1999, at B5; Mark Hyler, *Cumbee Murder Trial Begins*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 25, 1999, at B5; Mark Hyler, *Husband Had Reportedly Threatened Wife*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 23, 1998, at B4; Mark Hyler, *Husband Arrested In Slaying After Reporting Wife's Suicide*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 21, 1998, at B1.

19. October 27; Berkeley County

Live-in girlfriend stabbed her boyfriend in the chest during a bout of drinking and fighting. Mark Hyler, *Slaying Suspect Says She Wanted Beatings to Stop*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 29, 1998, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Berkeley Man Killed; Girlfriend Charged*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 28, 1998, at B1; *Woman Charged with Killing Boyfriend*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 29, 1998, at 5A.

20. November 14; Greenwood County

Husband shot wife in the head in their home. *Greenwood Woman Shot to Death, Husband Arrested*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 17, 1998, at B2; *Husband Charged in Woman's Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 17, 1998, at B3.

APPENDIX H**DOMESTIC—MALE/FEMALE RELATIONSHIP—PLANNING:
STALKING, LURING, ETC.****1. February 11; Colleton County**

As the victim ex-wife arrived at work, offender ex-husband shot her in the chest. *Coroner Says Suspect's Death Was Suicide*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 16, 1998, at B3; Rochelle Killingbeck, *Murder Suspect Dead of Apparent Suicide*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 15, 1998, at B3; *Man Sought in Wife's Killing*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 16, 1998 at B3; *Police Seek Suspect in Fatal Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 12, 1998, at B3.

2. April 30; Dorchester County

Offender ex-boyfriend broke into his ex-girlfriend's house, shot ex-girlfriend several times in the arm and chest with a shotgun. He told police he enjoyed it. Victoria Agnew, *Ex-Boyfriend Killing Suspect*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 2, 1998, at B1; Edward C. Fennell & Richard Green, Jr., *Record Low Tri-county Murders in 1998; Half of All Victims Were Black Men*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 17, 1999, at A1; *Solicitor Says He'll Seek Death Penalty in Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 21, 1998, at B5; *Trust Fund Established for Victim's Children*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 14, 1998, at B4; *Woman Killed in Knightsville Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 1, 1998, at B3; Bobbie Young, *Man Gets Death For Murder*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 30, 1999, at A1; Bobbie Young, *Convicted Murderer May Face Execution*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 28, 1999, at B1; Bobbie Young, *Weik's Taped Confession Played at Shooting Trial*, POST & COURIER (Charleston S.C.), May 27, 1999, at B1; Bobbie Young, *Judge Refuses Plea on Murder Charge*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 25, 1999, at B4.

3. June 5; Richland County

Victim had dated offender, but broke it off. The offender began stalking her, and she obtained a restraining order. Offender shot the victim three times in the parking lot of her workplace. Rick Brundrett, *Lawsuit Says Officials Failed to Protect Victim*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 16, 2000, at B7; Rick Brundrett, *2 Murder Trials Open This Week in Richland Co.*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.),

Dec. 13, 1999, at B1; Rick Brundrett, *Trial in Shooting Death Hinges on Suspect's Mental Competence*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 13, 1999, at B5; *Child Abandonment Suspect is Killed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 6, 1998, at B3; Clif LeBlanc, *Police Defend Handling of Stalking Case; Slain Woman Was Not Held Against Her Will, Officers Say*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 9, 1998, at A1; Kimathi Lewis, *Blow By Blow, Abuse Shatters Families*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 9, 2000, at B1; Kimathi Lewis, *'She Will Never Be Hurt Again' Hundreds Mourn Anderson's Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 11, 1998, at B1; *Richland Man's Trial Postponed By Floyd*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 15, 1999, at B3; Blair Stokes, *Suspect Had Been Committed; Man Accused in Slaying Released Four Days Earlier*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 7, 1998, at A1; Blair Stokes & Kimathi Lewis, *Woman Shot to Death at Work; Former Boyfriend Arrested; Victim Was Facing Charges of Leaving Child in Lot at Food Lion*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 6, 1998, at A1.

4. June 14; Darlington County

Offender boyfriend shot victim girlfriend once or twice in the head in a convenience store parking lot. *Boyfriend Faces Charge in Woman's Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 16, 1998, at B3.

5. June 26; Florence County

Victim wife and male friend were changing the oil in a the victim's car. Offender husband drove past, reversed, and started shooting. Victim died; male friend survived. *Florence Woman Killed, Man Injured in Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 28, 1998, at B2.

6. October 4; Lexington County

Offender was married and having an affair with the victim. The victim was trying to end their relationship. Offender shot her in the chest with a rifle at her home. Blair Stokes Blanks, *Man Testifies Shooting Was Accidental*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 1, 2000, at B3; *Man Gets Life in Prison in Slaying of Woman*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 2, 2000, at B3; *Wagener Man Charged in Gaston Fatal Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 5, 1998, at B2.

7. December 23; Orangeburg County

Ex-boyfriend offender shot ex-girlfriend through a window four times in the head and leg, as she talked on the phone in her bedroom. *A Woman Was Shot to Death at Her Home*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 25, 1998, at B2; Mark Hylar, *Orangeburg Man Suspect in Shooting; Arrested After Manhunt*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 25, 1998, at B1; *Orangeburg Woman Shot to Death in Bed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 24, 1998, at B3.

APPENDIX I

DOMESTIC—MALE/FEMALE RELATIONSHIP—PLANNED:
CONSPIRACY

1. February 22; Charleston County

Ex-girlfriend offender hired five other offenders to “teach her ex-boyfriend a lesson”; one of the five shot victim as he stepped off a bus, apparently taking the scheme further than the others had intended. Edward C. Fennell, *15-year-old Boy to be Tried as Adult in Murder, Robbery*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 2, 1998, at B3; Edward C. Fennell, *Death Was ‘Lesson’ Gone Wrong, Police Say*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 25, 1998, at A1; Edward C. Fennell, *Man Killed on His Way to Mother’s*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 24, 1998, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *3 Teens Sentenced to Prison for Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 24, 1999, at B3.

2. June 9; Horry County

Wife conspired with lover to have the lover kill her husband while wife and husband were walking on the beach during a trip to celebrate their third anniversary. Conspirators’ cover story was that an unknown robber killed husband. *Closing Arguments in Murder Trial Set Today*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 13, 1999, at B3; Kathleen Dayton, *Private Eyes Dispel Job Myths; Investigators Spend Most Time in Waiting*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), May 26, 1999, at D1; *Judge Denies Bond for Woman Charged with Killing Husband*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 27, 1998, at B2; Lauren Leach & Tonya Root, *Poole Lawyers Appeal Her Conviction*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 18, 1999, at C4; Lauren Leach, *Witnesses Say They Saw Suspect Going to Beach*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 13, 1999, at A1; Lauren Leach, *Interviews Indicate Renee Poole Expected Slaying*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 12, 1999, at A1; Lauren Leach, *Prosecution Opens Case vs. Poole*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 11, 1999, at A1; Lauren Leach, *Jury Selected to Hear Case Against Poole; Wife Charged in Husband’s Death on MB Trip*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 9, 1999, at C1; Lauren Leach, *Laptop Seized in Poole Case*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Mar. 9, 1999, at C1; Lauren Leach, *Wilson Seeks Death Penalty Against Poole; Judge Denies Bond Request*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 2, 1998, at A1; Lauren Leach, *Man Charged in Poole Killing Released*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Oct. 22, 1998, at C2; Lauren Leach, *Frazier Has Bail Set in Killing; Possible Release Upsets Victim’s Kin*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Oct.

17, 1998, at C2; Lauren Leach, *Police Question Wife's Story in MB Shooting*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), June 12, 1998, at 1A; Lauren Leach, *Suspect in N.C. Tourist's Slaying Brought to Myrtle Beach*; *Frazier Faces Murder, Armed Robbery Charges*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), July 3, 1998, at 1A; *Man Convicted of Killing Former Lover's Husband*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 20, 2000, at 4B; *Man Plans to Fight Extradition in Slaying, Beach Victim's Wife Will Return on Same Charges*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 17, 1998, at B6; *Murder Suspect Awaiting Hearing*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), June 19, 1998, at C7; *N.C. Man Slain in Myrtle Beach*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 12, 1998, at B3; *N.C. Woman, Boyfriend Indicted in Husband's Murder*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 29, 1999, at B2; *N.C. Woman Convicted of Killing Husband*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 15, 1999, at 7A; *Poole Murder Trial Draws November Date*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 4, 1999, at C3; *Poole Not Scared To Die, Suspect in Husband's Killing Misses Daughter Deeply*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 6, 1998, at A1; *Prosecutors Want Man's Bond Revoked*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 7, 1999, at C2; *Romantic Rival Killing Suspect Fights Extradition*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 17, 1998, at B1; Tonya Root, *Worker Testifies Against Frazier*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 18, 2000, at C1; Tonya Root, *Jury Selection Begins in Frazier Trial*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 15, 2000, at C3; Tonya Root, *Second Poole Trial To Begin Monday*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 13, 2000, at C3; Tonya Root, *Three Indicted in Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 27, 1999, at C1; Tonya Root, *Mother: Frazier Innocent Son Charged With Murder in Poole Death*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 12, 1999, at C4; Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1; *Suspects in Poole Case May Go to Court*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), June 16, 1998, at C2; *Suspect in S.C. Shooting Agrees To Be Extradited*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 3, 1998, at B6; *Suspect Says She Rejected Scheme by Lover to Kill Husband*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 8, 1999, at B3; *Testimony Details Night Husband was Killed*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 12, 1999, at B8; *Widow Faces Murder Charge*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 15, 1998, at B3; *Wife, Acquaintance Arrested in Fatal Beach Shooting of Husband*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 15, 1998, at B3; *Wife, Friend Charged in Husband's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 14, 1998, at B3; *Woman Accused of Plotting Husband's Murder Could Die*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 2, 1998, at B3; *Woman Convicted of Murdering Husband*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 14, 1999, at B3.

APPENDIX J

DOMESTIC—MALE/FEMALE RELATIONSHIP—MURDER/SUICIDE

The fact situation in each of these cases is the same: male kills female in whom he has a romantic interest, then kills himself. All the killings were done with guns. The only variable is the nature of the relationship between the offender and the victim, which will be indicated for each case.

1. February 25; Horry County

Husband/wife. Elaine Gaston, *Couple Found Dead in Their Car*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 27, 1998, at 1C. Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

2. March 7; Aiken County

Boyfriend/girlfriend. *Man Kills Girlfriend, Self After Fight in Car*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 8, 1998, at B2.

3. March 17; Beaufort

Ex-boyfriend/ex-girlfriend. *Apparent Murder-Suicide*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 18, 1998, at B2; *Man Apparently Kills Ex-Girlfriend, Self*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 18, 1998, at B6.

4. March 25; Cherokee County

Ex-boyfriend/ex-girlfriend. *Co-Workers Die in Murder-Suicide at Textile Plant*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 26, 1998, at B2; Janet S. Spencer, *Embroidery Plant Remembers Employee Shootings*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 27, 1999, at 8B; Janet S. Spencer, *Despite Relocating, Plant Reflects on Year Since Murder-Suicide Rocked Community*, SPARTANBURG HERALD-J. (S.C.), Mar. 26, 1999, at 1C.

5. Approximately May 21; Orangeburg County

Husband/wife. *Murder-Suicide Suspected in Deaths*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 24, 1998, at B3; *Orangeburg Couple Found Shot to Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 25, 1998, at B3.

6. June 16; Lexington County

Husband/wife (estranged). Blair Stokes, *Lexington Man Kills Estranged Wife, Himself*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 17, 1998, at B3.

7. September 12; Berkeley County

Husband/wife (estranged). Victoria Agnew, *Man Kills Wife, Turns Gun on Self*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 13, 1998, at A1; Mark Hyler, *Murder Victim Sought Help Days Earlier*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 16, 1998, at A1.

8. October 13; Laurens County

Boyfriend/girlfriend. *Man Apparently Waited Two Days After Killing Girlfriend To Kill Self*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 21, 1998, at 6A; *Man Kills Girlfriend, Then Self*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 21, 1998, at B6.

APPENDIX K

DOMESTIC—MALE/FEMALE RELATIONSHIP—COLLATERAL VICTIM

1. January 1; Greenville County

Offender boyfriend accosted girlfriend and another man in a car, shooting both. Girlfriend survived. *One Dead, One Injured in Greenville Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 3, 1998, at B3.

2. February 9; Newberry County

Offender shot his estranged wife and her male friend outside her apartment. The wife survived. *Man Charged with Killing Another, Shooting Wife*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 10, 1998, at B3; *New Charges Filed in Newberry Shootings*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 11, 1998, at B3.

3. May 9; Spartanburg County

Victim was arguing with offender, who was the new boyfriend of victim's ex-girlfriend. Offender shot victim. *Spartanburg Man Charged in Arcadia Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 18, 1998, at B3.

4. August 13; Pickens County

Estranged wife of offender received a suspicious call at work. She asked her two sons from a prior marriage to escort her home. Offender husband confronted the three and fired into the car as it was driving away, killing his stepson. *Liberty Man Charged with Killing Stepson*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 15, 1998, at B3; *Liberty Man Charged with Killing Stepson*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 15, 1998, at B2.

5. August 31; Chesterfield County

One victim, a sheriff's deputy, accompanied the other victim, the offender's wife, to her home pursuant to a court order to pick up her personal belongings. Offender shot both. The deputy's death is reported in this Appendix; wife's death is reported in Appendix G. James R. Lanford & Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Deputy, Woman Killed*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 1, 1998, at 1A; Elsa McDowell, *Police Death Sends Chills in Community*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 23, 1999, at B1.

6. September 15; Richland County

Victim went to offender's home, where his ex-girlfriend was living, and began beating her. Victim was shot by offender. *Columbia Man Killed in Lyles St. Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 16, 1998, at B3.

7. October 16; Lexington County

Offender went to victim's house looking for his ex-wife. Offender and victim fought, and victim died of a heart attack. *Investigators Upgrade Charge in Argument Death Case*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 21, 1998, at B3; Clif LeBlanc, *Coleman Pleads Guilty in Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 29, 2000, at B3; *State Charges Upgraded in Fatal Domestic Quarrel*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 21, 1998, at 12A; Blair Stokes, *Man Accused of Starting Fatal Heart Attack on Trial*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 27, 2000, at B1.

8. November 13; Orangeburg County

Offender ex-husband entered ex-wife's apartment shooting her and a male friend. The ex-wife survived. *Man Charged with Killing Ex-wife's Friend*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 16, 1998, at B2; *Orangeburg Man Charged in Murder*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 16, 1998, at B3.

APPENDIX L
DOMESTIC—CHILD VICTIM

1. January 1; Spartanburg County

Offenders, parents and grandmother of seven-week-old victim, caused his death by child abuse. *Boy's Death Leads to Charges Against Parent, Grandmother*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 8, 1998, at B2.

2. January 17; Greenville County

Father injured his two-year-old son via Shaken Baby Syndrome. Father and mother did not seek medical treatment for their child, who then died. *Greenville Police Reopen Case After Death of Toddler's Brother*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 22, 1998, at B2; *Jury Rejects Woman's Abuse Defense*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 16, 1999, at B12; *Man Gets 30 Years in Death of Boy*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 23, 1999, at A3.

3. January 28; Spartanburg County

Offender caused nineteen-month-old victim's death by child abuse from a torn liver. *Man Charged with Abuse in Death of His Nephew*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 31, 1998, at B2; *Police Investigate Death of 19-month-old*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 31, 1998, at B3.

4. February 22; Beaufort County

Offender was boyfriend of the mother of the seven-year-old victim. While the mother was away, the offender sexually abused and asphyxiated the victim. *Suspect Charged in Girl's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 25, 1998, at B3.

5. March 14; Greenville County

Offender broke into home of her boyfriend, who was the father of the two-year-old victim, fought with father of victim, and started a fire that killed the victim. *Woman Faces Charge of Murder for Fire*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 19, 1998, at B3.

6. June 24; York County

Offenders, father and mother of an infant less than a year old, sexually abused the infant for two months before conspiring to kill him for fear doctors would discover evidence of abuse on next visit; father smothered infant with a pillow. Seanna Adcox, *Jarrell's Trial to Stay in York County*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), June 12, 1999, at 1B; *Clover Man Pleads Guilty to Killing Son*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 13, 1999, at B6; Jeffrey Collins, *Community Left Reeling After Parents Sentenced in Infant Son's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 22, 1999, at B3; Jeffrey Collins, *Jarrell Probe, Trial Left Emotional Scars*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 21, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Sharron Jarrell Gets Life*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 20, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Sharron Jarrell Denies Role in Son's Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 19, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Deputy, Inmates Testify*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 17, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Trial Opens with Graphic Details*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 16, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Mother of Slain Infant To Be Tried This Week*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 14, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Sex Assault of Sibling Alleged*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 25, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Delay of One Trial Causes Domino Effect*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 25, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Judge Delays Jarrell Death Penalty Trial*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 14, 1999, at 1B; Jeffrey Collins, *Judge May Delay Start of Jarrell's Trial*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 5, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Jarrell Will Use Mental Defense*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 15, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Pre-trial Begins for Jarrell*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), June 8, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Mother Charged in Infant's Death Denied Bond*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), May 28, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Attorneys Want to Ban Photos*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), May 25, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Jarrell Trial Postponed*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), May 1, 1999, at 1B; Jeffrey Collins, *Death-row Inmate's Re-trial Irritates Solicitor*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 5, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Mom Charged in Infant's Death 8 Months Pregnant*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 20, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Complaint Arises Over Legal Note*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 28, 1998, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Death Penalty Sought in Child's Killing*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 3, 1998, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Clover Woman's Bond Set at \$150,000*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 12, 1998, at 1A; Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Mother Charged in Infant's Death Gives Birth to Son*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 26, 1999, at 1A; Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Clover Parents Charged*

in Death of 10-Month Old Son, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 2, 1998, at 1A; Melissa Inzerillo, *Mom, Dad Face Judge*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 14, 1998, at 1A; *Local Briefs*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Apr. 28, 1999, at 7A; *Man Convicted of Killing, Abusing Child Asks for New Trial*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 23, 2000, at 2B; Melissa Manware & Kenneth Gailliard, *Parents Investigated by DSS Before Son's Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 3, 1998, at 1A; *Notes for Lawyer May Get Prosecutors Fired*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 29, 1998, at B3; *Parents Charged in Infant Son's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 3, 1998, at B3; *Pretrial Hearings in Death Penalty Case Will Be Open to News Media*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, June 9, 1999; *Prosecutor: Man Implicated Himself in Death of Son*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 15, 1998, at B2; *Sharron Jarrell to Appeal Conviction*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 1, 1999, at 6A; *Sharron Jarrell Trial to Resume Today*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 18, 1999, at 9A; Andre J. Skerritt, *Jarrell Sentenced to Life*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 12, 1999, at 1A; Michele Snipe, *Mother Takes Stand—She Denies Plotting Killing, Seeing Abuse Scars on Son*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, Nov. 19, 1999, at 1Y; *The Year In Review 1999*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 31, 1999, at 1B; *Two Men Killed in Lexington Crash*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 13, 1999, at B6; *Voice of People*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 17, 1999, at 2E.

7. August 12; Horry County

Offender was unhappy because his sister had no milk for his cereal. He went to his mobile home next door, got a gun, and fired several shots into his sister's mobile home. One shot killed his seven-year-old niece. Lauren Leach, *Uncle Charged in Shooting Death of Loris Girl; Suspect Was Angry After Milk Argument*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 13, 1998, at A1; *Loris Man Charged with Shooting 7-Year-Old Niece to Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 29, 1999, at B2; *Man Charged with Shooting 7-Year-Old Niece to Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 14, 1998, at B2; Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

8. August 19; Sumter County

Offender father killed eleven-month-old son by blows to the head. *Man Charged in Death of His 11-Month-Old Son*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 4, 1998, at B2; *Sumter Man Charged in Death of His Son*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 4, 1998, at B3;

Sumter Man Charged in Death of Infant Son, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 4, 1998, at 8B.

9. October 8; Richland County

Victim, a six-year-old girl, had been placed by the Department of Social Services with her aunt's family. The aunt and her two boys (victim's cousins) beat the victim with a belt, who fell and hit her head on a coffee table. Victim died in the hospital from the head injury. John Allard, *Higher Charge Possible in Child Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 12, 1998, at A1; *Autopsy Reveals Girl Had Been Abused*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 12, 1998, at B3; *Boy Sentenced in Beating Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 18, 1999, at B3; Rick Brundrett, *Smith Gets 20 Years in Plea Deal*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 10, 1999, at A1; Rick Brundrett, *Cousin, 13, Sentenced in Beating Death Harbison-Area Boy to Be Confined at State*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 18, 1999, at B1; Rick Brundrett, *Woman Won't Get Bail in Niece's Beating Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 17, 1998, at A6; Rick Brundrett, *Bail Hearing in Girl's Death Set for Today; Aunt Charged in Beating To Appear Before Judge*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 16, 1998, at A11; Pat Butler, *Hundreds Mourn 6-Year-Old Killed in Beating*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 16, 1998, at A1; Carolyn Click, *Hard Lessons of Child Abuse*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 26, 2000, at E1; *Cousins Also Charged in Girl's Beating Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 15, 1998, at 6A; *Cousins Charged in S.C. Girl's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 15, 1998, at A1; *Funeral Held for 6-Year-Old Beating Victim*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 17, 1998, at 3B; *Girl's Aunt Indicted in Her Beating Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 14, 1999, at B6; Dave Morantz, *Young Victim Buried*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 17, 1998, at A1; Blair Stokes, *Aunt Headed to Trial for Niece's Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 6, 1999, at B3; Blair Stokes, *Court to Weigh Adult's Influence in 6-Year-Old's Death; Teen-Ager Faces Charges in Fatal Beating of Girl*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 23, 1998, at B1; Blair Stokes, *Death Shows Tragic Truth; No One Noticed Despair of Little Charnell Smith*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 18, 1998, at A1; Blair Stokes, *2 Boys Held in Beating Cousins Charged in Girl's Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 15, 1998, at A1; Blair Stokes & Cliff LeBlanc, *Probe Expands to Family; Prosecutors Might Charge Children in Girl's Beating*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 14, 1998, at A1; Blair Stokes, *Murder Charge Sought in Child's Death; Victim, 6, Had Longed to Live with Aunt Held in Her Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 13, 1998, at A1; Blair Stokes, *6-Year-*

Old Killed After Beating; Was Reluctant To Go Home, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 11, 1998, at A1; *Blair Stokes, 6-Year-Old Dies; Aunt is Charged Reports Say Girl Was Beaten for Missing School Bus Stop*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 10, 1998, at A1; *Woman Gets 20 Years for Death of Niece*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 10, 1999, at B1; *Woman Gets 20 Years in Child's Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 10, 1999, at 4B.

10, 11. October 29, November 8; Orangeburg County

Four-year-old was found drowned in a pond behind his house; the death originally ruled accidental. Ten days later the four-year-old's five-year-old brother was found suffocated in a car. Offender, a distant relative, was charged with the five-year-old's death; the investigation of the four-year-old's death was reopened with the relative as the prime suspect. *Boy, 5, Found in Auto Trunk Dies*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 9, 1998, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Twin Deaths Crush Family*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 11, 1998, at A1; Kimathi Lewis, *Sibling's Deaths Seen as Homicides; Sister's Drowning Had Been Ruled Accidental*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 18, 1998, at B1; Kimathi Lewis, *Autopsy Finds Boy Suffocated; Questions Still Linger in Deaths of Siblings*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 11, 1998, at B3; Kimathi Lewis, *Police Reopen Case of Girl's Death After Brother Found Dead*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 11, 1998, at 6A; Kimathi Lewis, *Police Reopen Investigation; Suspicions Aroused in Girl's Oct. 29 Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 10, 1998, at B1; Kimathi Lewis, *Police Arrest Teen-Ager in Death of 5-Year-Old Boy*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 9, 1998, at B1; *Teenager Charged in Death of Child Found in Car Trunk*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 9, 1998, at 6A.

12. November 23; Horry County

Father poured gasoline around a van in which his two-year-old daughter was sitting and set it afire, burning her to death. *Conway Man is Sentenced to Die*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 18, 2000, at B3; *Father To Be Charged in Fire Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 25, 1998, at B7; *Father's Bond Set at \$400,000 in Girl's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 26, 1999, at B3; *Judge Sets Bond in Murder Case*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Apr. 24, 1999, at C2; Lauren Leach, *Man Charged in Daughter's Death*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 8, 1998, at C1; Lauren Leach, *Father Facing Charges in Death of Daughter Man Injured, Girl Killed in Blaze*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 26, 1998,

at C1; Lauren Leach, *2-Year-Old's Death in Fire Shocks Her Neighbors; Police Suspect Girl's Father Burned Van*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 26, 1998, at B6; Lauren Leach, *Community Mourns Toddler Burned in Fire*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 25, 1998, at A1; Lauren Leach, *Father Could Be Charged in Burning Death*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 24, 1998, at A1; *Man Sentenced To Die for Killing 2-Year-Old Daughter*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Aug. 18, 2000; *Murder-Arson Charges Await Dad in Toddler Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 25, 1998, at B3; *Police to Serve Passaro Warrants*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 1, 1998, at C4; Tonya Root, *Passaro Pleads Guilty*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 15, 2000, at C1; Tonya Root, *Father Could Face Death in Child's Burning*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 12, 1999, at C1.

APPENDIX M
DOMESTIC—OTHER RELATIONSHIPS

1. January 17; Lancaster County

Offender, who had a history of mental illness, stabbed his father sixteen times. Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Fatal Stabbing Shocks Victim's Acquaintances*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 20, 1998, at 4A; Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Officials Charge Son with Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 19, 1998, at 1A.

2. January 25; Charleston County

Offender brother shot his brother for an unknown reason. Edward C. Fennell, *Brother Charged in Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 27, 1998, at B1.

3. March 7; Horry County

Offender shot victim three times in the back and once in the head; victim's brother and offender originally claimed they were victims of a burglary. Surviving brother was deemed an accessory after the fact to a domestic confrontation killing. Isaac J. Bailey, *Surfside Beach Man Shot to Death—Killing Appears To Be Part of Burglary Try*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Mar. 8, 1998, at 1C; Elaine Gaston, *Man Charged In Death*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Apr. 1, 1998, at 6C; Elaine Gaston, *Police Charge MB Man in Deerfield Slaying—Attach Appears Domestic-Related*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Mar. 28, 1998, at 6C; Tonya Root, *Man Enters Guilty Plea in Slaying*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 9, 2000, at C2; Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

4. April 12; Spartanburg County

Offender shot his brother, then himself in a murder/suicide. *Brothers Found Dead in Motel an Apparent Murder, Suicide*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 14, 1998, at B2.

5. August 21; Aiken County

Offender stepson stabbed stepfather for unknown reasons. *Stepson Charged in Stabbing Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 23, 1998, at 4B; *Stepson Charged in Stepfather's Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 23, 1998, at B3.

6. September 12; Dillon County

Stepson strangled stepmother for unknown reasons. *Diabetic Murder Suspect Allowed to Give Himself Insulin*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 23, 1998, at B2; *Man Accused of Crime Dies After Suicide Attempt*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 4, 1998, at B5; *Murder Suspect Under Suicide Watch*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 22, 1998, at B3; *Suspect Hospitalized After Apparent Suicide Attempt*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 22, 1998, at B2.

7. November 10; Horry County

Offender-father shot at his son five times, hitting him twice, for unknown reasons. *Man Charged With Killing His Son During Argument*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 13, 1998, at B2; *Man Pleads No Contest to Killing Son*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 7, 2000, at C2; Tonya Root, *Man Charged in His Son's Death Victim, 30, Was Shot Twice After Squabble*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 12, 1998, at C3; Tonya Root, *Police Busy in 1998 Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1; *William Johnson*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 15, 1998, at C2.

8. November 22; Anderson County

Victim-mother confronted offender-son about his cocaine usage. Later, offender shot his mother and her husband as they watched TV. Husband survived. *Man Killed Mother, Shot Father, Police Say*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 24, 1998, at B3; *Upstate Man Charged in Parent's Shootings*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 24, 1998, at B2.

9. November 30; Union County

Offender-stepson shot victim-stepfather in the back of the head with a rifle during an argument; stepson claimed he feared for his safety. *Union Teen-ager Charged in Stepfather's Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 4, 1998, at B2.

10. December 11; York County

Offender-son and his cousin conspired to kill offender's mother. Offender beat victim to death with a baseball bat. *18-Year-Old Charged with Killing Mother*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 13, 1998, at B3; Jeffrey Collins, *Teen Gets 30 Years For Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), May 7, 1999, at 1A; Joe Hosey, *Teen Pleads Guilty to 2 Felony Charges*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 25, 1999, at 4A; Joe Hosey, *Suspect Misses Funeral*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 16, 1998, at 4A; Joe Hosey, *Teen Faces Second Charge As Slaying Accomplice*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 15, 1998, at 4A; Joe Hosey, *Sheriff: Teen Confessed to Killing Mom*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 13, 1998, at 1B; Joe Hosey, *Son Charged in Mother's Slaying*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 12, 1998, at 1A; Michele D. Snipe, *DSS Says It Handled Case of Convicted Teen Properly*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, May 18, 1999, at 1Y; Michele D. Snipe, *Agencies Knew of Troubles; Murdered Woman Was Reported Twice to DSS*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, May 8, 1999, at 1Y; Michele D. Snipe, *DSS, Mental Health Agency Involved 8 Years Before Son Killed Mother*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, May 8, 1999, at 1C; Michele D. Snipe, *Son Pleads Guilty to Killing Mother Repentant Dad Takes the Blame: I Could Have Stopped This*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, May 7, 1999, at 1Y.

APPENDIX N ACQUAINTANCE DISPUTES

1. January 11; Horry County

Offender and victim were arguing outside an arcade; offender took money from victim, who punched the offender. Offender shot victim in the neck. Offender was acquitted. Lauren Leach, *Man Once Accused in Shooting Killed*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 22, 2000, at C2; *Longs Man Charged in Sunday Homicide*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 14, 1998, at 5C; *Police Seek Leads in Man's Shooting Death*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 23, 2000, at C2; Tonya Root, *Jury Finds Longs Man Innocent in Shooting*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 13, 2000, at C4.

2. February 14; Charleston County

Offender was angry with victim because the victim had kicked in offender's bedroom door, drank his liquor, and had sex in his bed the night before. Offender shot the victim in the chest. *Judge Denies Bail in Shotgun Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 16, 1998, at B3; Rochell Killingbeck, *Dispute Ends in Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 15, 1998, at B1.

3. February 16; Chester County

Offender and victim, a friend, were arguing. Offender hit victim on the head with a full bottle of beer. *Beer-bottle Attack Kills Chester Man*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 21, 1998, at 1B.

4. March 27; Charleston County

Victim was married to one of offender's relatives. Victim was riding a bicycle; offender pulled up in a car, got out, and shot victim in the chest. Victoria Agnew, *I Charged in Cyclist's Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 10, 1998, at B1; *Bail Denied for Man in Downtown Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 11, 1998, at B3; Edward C. Fennell, *Woman Questioned in Matthews' Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 31, 1998, at B3; Rochelle Killingbeck, *Peninsular Man Killed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 28, 1998, at B1; *Police Arrest Woman in Fatal Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 1, 1998, at B3.

5. March 29; Horry County

Offender was a guest at victim's birthday party; offender and victim argued, and offender shot victim twice in the upper body. *Levi Gause*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), May 23, 2000, at C9; *Longs Man Charged in Homicide at Party*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Mar. 31, 1998, at C4; Tonya Root, *Two Men Face Murder Charges*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Sept. 26, 1998, at C4; *Weekend Shooting Leaves 1 Dead, 1 Jailed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 31, 1998, at B3.

6. April 2; Charleston County

Victim had previously pistol-whipped and threatened one of the two offenders. For revenge, the two chased the victim down, and one of the offenders hit the victim with the butt of the gun and shot him. Victoria Agnew & Mark Hyler, *Victim's Mother Blames the Streets*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 17, 1999, at A1; Victoria Agnew, *Teen Held in Death of Ex-friend*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 3, 1998, at B1; Edward C. Fennell, *Second Suspect Surrenders in Shotgun Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 4, 1998, at B3; Richard Green, Jr., *Teen Gets 14 Years in '98 Death of Man Who Beat Him*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 25, 2000, at C3; Ellen B. Meacham, *North Charleston Man Gets 23 Years in Shooting Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 24, 2000, at B1.

7. April 17; Richland County

Offender and another person were fighting in the parking lot of a nightclub. Offender pulled a gun and hit the other person on the head with it. The gun discharged, killing the victim who was a bystander. Kimathi Lewis, *Man Charged in Cousin's Fatal Shooting; Investigators Make Arrest in Second Case*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 24, 1998, at B3.

8. April 28; Richland County

Offender and victim were arguing in a parking lot. Offender stabbed the victim in the chest, face, and hand. Blair Stokes, *Man Charged in Killing Outside Eastover Store*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 29, 1998, at B3.

9. June 6; Lexington County

Offender and victim were neighbors. They got into an argument at a motel, and the offender hit victim on the head with a lamp and strangled him with a belt. *Man Found Stabbed in Local Motel Room*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 7, 1998, at B2; *Police Identify Dead Man in Motel, Charge Acquaintance*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 8, 1998, at B3; *Woman Gets 25 Years in Death at Lexington Motel*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 7, 1999, at B3.

10. June 19; Richland County

Victim had a dispute with three offenders the previous day. Offenders shot the victim on the street while driving by. *3 Charged After Eastover Man Wounded in Drive-By Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 19, 1998, at B3; *Brothers Sentenced in Fatal Shooting of Eastover Man*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 16, 1999, at B3; *Murder Charge Mulled in Eastover Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 25, 1998, at B3.

11. July 18; Horry County

Offender visited victim in a motel room on friendly terms, but an argument ensued, and the offender shot victim once in the head. Helena Oliviero, *Solicitor Says Scott Killed After Argument*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 5, 1998, at C1. Not reported in SLED Report.

12. July 24; Laurens County

Three female offenders beat acquaintance victim to death outside his home. *Three Women Charged in Beating Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 27, 1998, at B3; *Three Women Charged in Beating Death of Man*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 27, 1998, at B2.

13. July 24; Richland County

Offender and victim were arguing in an apartment. The argument spilled out into the street, and offender shot victim once from behind and twice from in front. *22-Year Old Man Arrested in Connection with Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 26, 1998, at B3; *Man Killed in Shooting off North Main Street*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July, 25, 1998, at B3.

14. July 25; Cherokee County

Offender shot victim with a shotgun. *Gaffney Man is Charged in Neighbor's Fatal Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 27, 1998, at B2.

15. July 25; Richland County

Two offenders and victim were arguing in victim's yard. One of the suspects shot victim in the face with a shotgun. *Columbia Man, 30, Found Shot in Yard*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 26, 1998, at B3; *Police Search for Suspect in Shooting Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 8, 1998; *Second Suspect Arrested in July Shooting Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 9, 1998, at B3; Blair Stokes, *Man's Fatal Shooting Might Not Be Random*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 29, 1998, at B3; *Woman, 38, Charged in Shooting Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 28, 1998, at B3.

16. August 23; Horry County

Offender and victim were brothers-in-law. They argued outside an apartment building, then went inside where offender shot victim twice. Lauren Leach, *Police Investigate Conway Shootings*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 25, 1998, at C1.

17. August 27; Charleston County

Victim and offender had earlier argued over a bicycle. Offender left, came back with a gun, and shot victim while onlookers begged him not to. Edward C. Fennell, *Police Seek Boy in Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 28, 1998, at A1; Herb Frazier, *West Side Adults Frustrated; Youths Want Blood*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 29, 1998, at A9; Mark Hyler, *Teen Charged in Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 29, 1998, at A1.

18. August 28; Richland County

Victim and one of the offenders had argued earlier. Offender and cohort offenders later chased victim down and offender shot him. *A Guilty Plea Prevented a Retrial for a Columbia Man Accused in the Shooting Death of a 16-Year-Old Boy*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 17, 1999, at B3; Rick Brundrett, *Jury Deadlocks, Man to be Retried in Shooting Death; Juror Blocked Conviction, Assistant Solicitor Says*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 24, 1999, at B3;

Chuck Cumbo, *Police Seeking Victim's Name And His Killer*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 30, 1998, at B1.

19. September 1; Richland County

A group of people were talking in the street when an argument broke out. Offender fired four or five shots, killing victim. Blair Stokes, *Man, 21, Killed on Clinton St.*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 2, 1998, at B3.

20. September 3; Williamsburg County

Following an argument at a card game, offenders shot two men from the game; the victim died, and the other man survived. *Two Migrant Workers Arrested in Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 6, 1998, at B3; *Two Migrant Workers Held in Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 6, 1998, at B2.

21. September 18; Chester County

Offender and victim had been arguing for months over a man or a child. Finally, offender stabbed victim in the throat, face, and chest. Jeffrey Collins, *Police: Stabbing Was Ending of Ongoing Quarrel*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 20, 1998, at 1B; Jeffrey Collins, *Teen Charged in Killing of 20-Year-Old*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 19, 1998, at 1B.

22. October 11; Spartanburg County

Two offenders argued with victim and another man at a party. Offenders shot both; other man survived. *Man Killed, 2nd Hurt After Upstate Gunfight*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 13, 1998, at B3; *One Killed, One Wounded in Spartanburg Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 13, 1998, at B2.

23. October 17; Spartanburg County

After a night of drinking, victim tried to stop offender from driving; offender stabbed victim in the chest. *Friend Stabs, Kills Man To Stop Him from Driving*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 19, 1998, at B2.

24. October 28; Horry County

Offender shot acquaintance victim behind a bar for unknown reasons. Anita Brown, *Man, 18, Shot to Death in MB*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Oct. 29, 1998, at C1; Tonya Root, *Six Residents Indicted on Murder Charges*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), July 10, 1999, at C2; Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998, Domestic Violence Let to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

25. December 16; York County

Victim was arguing with acquaintances. Offender tried to break up the fight and began arguing with victim. Offender and victim fought, and offender stabbed victim fifteen times. Seanna Adcox, *Stabbing Suspect's Cousin Tells 'His Side of Story'*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 19, 1998, at 1B; *Births*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Apr. 3, 1999, at 8C; Jeffrey Collins, *Grand Jury Indicts Alleged Sex Offender*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), June 19, 1999, at 1B; Jeffrey Collins, *Bond Set at \$130,000 for Suspect in Catawba Area Stabbing*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 9, 1999, at 2B.

26. December 27; Richland County

Offender and victim had an altercation in a home. Offender shot victim under the chin. Roddie Burris, *1 Arrested for Fatal Shooting; Victim Was Left at Area Hospital*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 28, 1998, at B1.

27. December 28; Charleston County

During a chance roadside encounter, offender and victim argued. Offender shot victim. Edward C. Fennell, *2 Families Seek 'Why' of Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 30, 1998, at A1.

28. December 28; Kershaw County

Offender and victim argued over a woman; offender shot victim in the neck. *Columbia Teen Arrested in Death of Camden Man*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 30, 1998, at B3.

29. December 29; Berkeley County

Four offenders had an ongoing dispute with victim's friend. The four offenders waited outside an apartment and fired guns when the

friend and victim emerged. The friend was unharmed, but the victim died from a shotgun pellet severing his artery. Victoria Agnew, *Suspect in Killing Still Sought*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 2, 1999, at B3; Victoria Agnew, *23-Year-Old Killed Outside His Home*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 30, 1998, at B1; *Fifth Slaying Suspect Turns Himself In*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 4, 1999, at B3; Richard Green, Jr., *4th Man Convicted in Sangaree Apartment Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 27, 2000, at B5; Mark Hyler, *Walker Found Guilty of Manslaughter*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 27, 1999, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Expert: Fatal Shot Not from Walker*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 26, 1999, at B4; Mark Hyler, *I Found Guilty in Sangaree Man's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 12, 1999, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Slaying Investigators Upset Bond Was Set in Their Absence*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 15, 1999, at B4; Mark Hyler & Brenna Reilly, *Another Suspect Arrested in Sangaree Shooting Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 12, 1999, at B4; Mark Hyler, *Witnesses Say Teen Drew Gun*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 7, 1999, at B4; Mark Hyler, *Teen Faces Gun Charges*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 6, 1999, at B1; Mark Hyler, *3 Denied Bail in Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 5, 1999, at B4; Mark Hyler, *Police Catch 2 More Suspects in Man's Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Concerned Neighbor to be Missed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 31, 1998, at B1.

APPENDIX O

STRANGER DISPUTES—ARISING IN A BAR/NIGHTCLUB

1. January 1; Orangeburg County

Unknown offender shot victim during an argument that flowed from a bar, into the street, and into a restaurant. Three others were wounded. Allison Askins, *Orangeburg Man Killed in Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 2, 1998, at B1; *Restaurant Shooting Kills 1, Wounds 3*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 2, 1998, at B3; *Three Wounded, One Killed, in Huddle House Shooting*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 2, 1998, at 5B.

2. January 24; Charleston County

Offender ran over victim with a vehicle, outside a nightclub. *Murder in 1998; Charleston, Berkeley and Dorchester Counties*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 17, 1999, at A1.

3. April 30; Berkeley County

Offender and victim met and danced together at a bar, then left together. Shortly thereafter, victim was found shot in an adjacent parking lot. Victoria Agnew, *Family Won't Forgive Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 2, 1998, at B4; Victoria Agnew, *Night on Town is Victim's Last*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 1, 1998, at A1; Mark Hyler, *Bost Makes Plea Deal in Moore Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 19, 1998, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Death Haunts Family*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 24, 1998, at B1.

4. July 12; Florence County

Two groups of men left a nightclub to fight in the parking lot; many of them went to their cars to get guns. Victim was shot by an unidentified offender. *Timmons ville Man Killed in Weekend Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July, 14, 1998, at B2.

5. August 15; Sumter County

A melee broke out in the parking lot of a nightclub; several people fired weapons and offender's bullet killed victim. *Police Drop Murder Charge Against Man*, SUNNEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Aug. 24, 1998, at C3; *Police Release Santee Man Who Had Been Charged with Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 24, 1998, at 6A.

6. September 5; Richland County

Offender stabbed victim three times in the chest while arguing outside a nightclub. *Man Stabbed to Death Outside of Night Club*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Nov. 7, 1998, at 6B; *Woman Charged in Stabbing Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Nov. 7, 1998, at B3.

7, 8. September 18; Orangeburg County

Offender shot two South Carolina State University students in the parking lot of a nightclub during an argument. Pat Butler, *Families Struggle to Cope with Loss of Loved Ones*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 19, 1998, at A1; *Dozens Gather to Mourn, Remember Homicide Victims*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 22, 2000, at B6; Mark Hyler, *Orangeburg Man Arrested in S.C. State Slayings*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 18, 1998, at B1; Mark Hyler, *2 S.C. State Students Die in Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 19, 1998, at B1; *Investigation Continues in Orangeburg Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 20, 1998, at B2; *Man Charged in Slaying of 2 S.C. State Students*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 18, 1998, at B2; Blair Stokes, *S.C. State Students Killed in Shooting Nightclub; Fight Turns Deadly; 6 Have Died This Semester*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 19, 1998, at A1.

9. September 20; Richland County

Offender shot victim in the head during an argument outside a nightclub. Kimathi Lewis, *Man Killed in Shooting at Nightclub*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 21, 1998, at B1.

APPENDIX P
STRANGER DISPUTES—OTHERS

1. January 30; Richland County

Offender and victim fired at each other during an argument at a gas station. Victim was hit. *Columbia Man Dies from Gunshot Wound*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 1, 1998, at B3.

2. May 16; Charleston County

Offender and victim were arguing over fishing rights to a pond; offender shot victim in the abdomen. Edward C. Fennell, *Grand Jury Indicts Man Over John's Islander's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 6, 1999, at B12; *John's Island Man Killed Near Home*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 17, 1998, at B3; Brenna Reilly, *Suspect Held in Weekend Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 18, 1998, at B1.

3. June 17; Charleston County

Victim was sitting on a bike chatting when offender fired from a distance and bullet struck victim; police believe offender shot the wrong person. Victoria Agnew, *Bullet Takes Woman's Life, Teen Girl in Police Custody*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 18, 1998, at A1; Edward C. Fennell, *Neighbors Remember Victim*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 19, 1998, at A1. Not reported in SLED Report.

4. October 7; Richland County

A friend of victim's argued with three or four men. As the victim and friend walked away, one of the men shot the victim. *Man Killed, Another Injured in Back-to-Back Shootings*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 9, 1998, at B3.

APPENDIX Q DRUG DISPUTES

1. February 15; Lexington County

Victim was apparently an innocent bystander killed in a gun battle where three offenders were trying to rob another offender of drugs and money. Chuck Crumbo, *Woman Shot in Robbery; Police Say 20-Year-Old's Friends Sought Drugs; Money of Teen*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 20, 1998, at B1; Neil White & Chuck Crumbo, *Woman Shot, Killed After Argument at Residence*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 16, 1998, at B3.

2, 3, 4. March 2; Lancaster County

Three offenders killed three other men in a drug dispute. One victim was gunned down, and his body was dumped; the other two victims were shot, and their bodies were burned in a car. Allison Bruce, *Local Family Touched by 'Angel,'* THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 3, 1999, at 1A; Allison Burce & Jeffrey Collins, *The Wait for Justice Difficult on Families*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 28, 1999, at 6A; Jeffrey Collins, *Kimball Lee Gets Reduced Sentence*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 2, 2000, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Last Legal Action Closes Books on 1998 Triple-Murder Case*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 2, 2000, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Adkins Found Guilty*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 18, 2000, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Adkins Final Defendant in 1998 Triple-Slaying Case*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 15, 2000, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Third Suspect Awaits Trial in Triple Slaying*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 13, 2000, at 1B; Jeffrey Collins, *Slain Youths Friend Enters Guilty Plea*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), May 4, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Lee Gets Six Years*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Apr. 30, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Pain Keeps Mother Away from Son's Grave*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 28, 1999, at 5A; Jeffrey Collins & Joe Hosey, *Death Penalty Sought Against Murder Suspect*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 18, 1998, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Families: Talk Show Emphasized Killings*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 15, 1999, at 1B; Jeffrey Collins, *Adkins' Lawyer: Confession Won't Damage My Client's Case*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 30, 1998, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Cramer Pleads Guilty, 19-Year-Old Gets Life in Killings of 2 Men*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 29, 1998, at 1A; *Coroner Releases Bodies of Two Found Dead, But Not Identification*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 6, 1998, at B2; Al Dozier, *Homicide Suspect Faces More Charges*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Apr. 11,

1998, at 1B; Jonathan Dube, *Killer of 3 Apologizes to Sobbing Families, Young Men Lost Lives in Drug Deal Gone Bad*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 29, 1998, at B5; Jonathan Dube & Karen Bair, *Three Arrested in Killings of 3 They Knew*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 8, 1998, at B3; *Families Mourn Suspects, Victims*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 29, 1998, at 1A; Kenneth A. Gailliard, *Violent Homicides Rose in '98*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 25, 1999, at 1A; Joe Hosey, *Accused Killer's Lawyer Steps Down from Case*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 19, 1998, at 1B; Melissa Inzerillo, *Probable Cause Hearing Set for Two Homicide Suspects*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 27, 1998, at 1B; Melissa Manware, *Stolen Rifle Found in Murder Suspect's Room*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 19, 1998, at 4A; Melissa Manware & Andrew Skeritt, *Suspect's Family Feels as if Six Sons Were Lost*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 15, 1998, at 1A; Jeff McMenemy, *Year After Killings, Prison Letters Heal*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Feb. 28, 1999, at 1A; *Mom of Possible Victim Says She Was 'Robbed' of Her Son*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 7, 1998, at B2; *One Victim's Body Identified in Mysterious Triple Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 5, 1998, at B2; *Rock Hill Teen-ager Admits Shooting Pair*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 30, 1998, at B6; Lee Simmons, *Mom Gets Moment with Montel*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Oct. 13, 1999, at 4A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *Kimball Lee Home After Two Years Behind Bars*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 17, 2000, at 1A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *Murder Suspect Denied Bond*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 11, 1999, at 1A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *1998 Murder Suspect to Seek Bond*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Dec. 10, 1999, at 1A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *Families to Recount Tragedy on T.V.*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 29, 1999, at 1A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *Confessed Killer's Statement Offends Sim's Mother*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 30, 1998, at 4A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *Lee's Mom Appears as 'Emissary' for Son*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 29, 1998, at 10A; Andrew J. Skeritt & Melissa Manware, *Trail of Trouble*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 15, 1998, at 1A; Andrew J. Skeritt, *Authorities Search Subdivisions*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 10, 1998, at 4A; Blair Stokes, *Survivor Surrenders*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 12, 1998, at 1A; Blair Stokes, *3 Charged in Murders*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 8, 1998, at 1A; *3 Arrested in Triple Killing; Drugs Blamed*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 9, 1998, at B3; *Voice of the People*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 9, 1999, at 11A.

5. March 3; Richland County

Victim was in a motel parking lot trying to purchase cocaine from two offenders when one of them shot him. *Police Name Two Suspects in Weekend Slaying at Motel*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 2, 1998, at B3; *Police Seek Suspect in Fatal Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 31, 1998, at B3.

6. April 10; Aiken County

Three offenders robbed a crack house, and one of them shot occupant victim. Offenders killed another victim during a carjacking later in 1998.³⁷⁷ *Columbia Police Arrest Man in Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 3, 1998, at B3; *Gaston Man Charged in Georgia Man's Killing*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 24, 1998, at B2; *Pelion Man Captured, Charged with April Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 20, 1998, at B3; Blair Stokes, *Salley Gunfire Leaves One Dead, Police Seek Two Suspects After Argument Turns Fatal*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 12, 1998, at B3; *Suspect Arrested in Salley Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 24, 1998, at B3; *Suspect in 1998 Killing Returned to S.C.*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 20, 1999.

7, 8, 9. April 11; Marion County

Six masked offenders broke into a house after midnight, ordered the occupants to lie down, and then fired at them, killing three of them. The killings were presumed to be drug-related. John Allard, *Officials Probe Triple Homicide, Mullins Shooting Possibly Related to Drug Dispute*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 14, 1998, at B2; *Brothers Sentenced in Triple Murder Case*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Jan. 19, 2001; *Home Shooting Leaves 3 Dead, 2 Injured*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 12, 1998, at B3; Blair Stokes, *Three Men Shot, Killed in Rural Marion County*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Apr. 12, 1998, at B1; *Trial of Two Men Charged in Triple Killing Case Moved and Postponed*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Sept. 1, 1999; *Two Brothers Found Guilty in Triple Murder Case*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Sept. 23, 1999. Not reported in SLED Report.

10. August 3; Richland County

Victim was asked by men in a car if he had drugs to sell; he said he did and directed them where to meet him. As victim approached the

377. See *infra* Appendix R at no.17.

car at the meeting point, he was shot. *Suspect in Shooting Death Arrested by Florida Deputies*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 14, 1998, at B3; *Teen Killed in Drug Deal in Dutch Fork Area*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 4, 1998, at B3.

11. August 28; Charleston County

Offender and victim were disputing about a drug deal. Offender pushed victim into the path of an oncoming car. *Bail Denied in Traffic Killing Case*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 12, 1998, at B3; Mark Hyler, *Man Thrown into Car's Path Dies*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 29, 1998, at B1; *Man Charged with Pushing 2nd to Death in Front of Car*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 12, 1998, at B2; *Man Thrown in Path of Oncoming Car Dies*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 30, 1998, at B2. Not reported in SLED Report.

12. September 3; Sumter County

Offender shot victim in the chest in a crowded pool hall as a result of a drug dispute. *Police Briefs*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 4, 1998, at 2B.

13. December 4; Darlington County

Victim was shot in the back of the head as he worked at a convenience store. Police believe killing was drug-related. *4 Sought in Shooting Death of Convenience Store Owner*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 8, 1998, at B2; Jeannine F. Hunter, *Florence Family Mourns Shooting Victim*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 17, 1998, at C1.

14. Approximately December 15; Orangeburg County

Victim's body found shot about one-quarter mile from his home. Offender was a juvenile acquaintance. Police believed crime was a drug-related burglary, robbery, and kidnapping. *Missing Man Found Dead; Teen Charged with Murder*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 26, 1998, at B2; *Missing Man's Body Found Near His Home*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 25, 1998, at B3.

APPENDIX R

DURING ANOTHER FELONY

1. January 3; Kershaw County

Offender entered victim's place of employment, set fire to the office, beat, robbed, and kidnapped the victim, later forcing the victim out of a stolen truck offender was driving. Victim died twelve days later. *Bethune Man Gets Life for 1998 Murder*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Apr. 4, 2000; *Security Guard Dies After Attack*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Jan. 19, 1998, at 5A. Not reported in SLED Report.

2. January 5; Oconee County

At least two offenders robbed a store and killed the clerk. *Third Suspect Charged in Merchant's Death*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 9, 1998, at B2; *Wrongfully Imprisoned Man Sues*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 7, 1999, at B7.

3. January 6; Charleston County

Offender robbed a cab driver, stabbed the driver twenty times and slit his throat, and stole the cab. Victoria Agnew, *Bail Denied in Slaying of Cab Driver*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 14, 1998, at B3; Victoria Agnew, *Cabbie's Shooting Death Rattles Other Local Drivers*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 7, 1998, at A6; Victoria Agnew, *Suspect Sought in Cabbie's Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 7, 1998, at A1; Edward C. Fennell, *W. Ashley Man Charged in Cab Driver's Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 13, 1998, at B1; Rochelle Killingbeck, *Taxi Driver Cabbies Worry About the Job, the Deaths*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 11, 1998, at A1; Ellen B. Meacham, *Man Gets 21 Years in Fatal Knifing of Cabbie*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 6, 2000, at B1; *Suspect in Homicide of Cab Driver*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 8, 1998, at B3; *Yellow Cab Thanks Community*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 9, 1998, at A16.

4. January 10; Charleston County

Male offender and female victim had been drinking together. Offender raped victim, beat her beyond recognition, and strangled her. Victoria Agnew, *Officials Tentatively Identify Woman Found Dead at Plaza*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 13, 1998, at B3; Richard Green, Jr., *Killer Gets 30 Years for Rape, Death of Woman*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 19, 1999, at A1; Richard

Green, Jr., *Jury Out on Rape, Murder*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 18, 1999, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Attorney Calls for Mistrial*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 17, 1999, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Man Says Woman Was Alive When He Left*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 16, 1999, at B12; Rochelle Killingbeck, *Suspect Says He Saw Victim Night Before Body Was Found*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 15, 1998, at B3; Rochelle Killingbeck, *James Island Man Arrested in Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 14, 1998, at B1; Rochelle Killingbeck, *Death of Woman a Mystery*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 11, 1998, at B1.

5. January 13; Orangeburg County

Three offenders burglarized a home and shot the resident several times. *Police Charge Third Teen in Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 18, 1998, at B3; *Robbery Suspected in Eutawville Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 15, 1998, at B3.

6. January 24; Greenville County

Offender robbed a convenience store and held a gun to the head of the clerk, who died of a heart attack. *Murder Charges Filed After Cashier Dies*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 25, 1998, at B3. Not reported in the SLED Report.

7. January 26; Colleton County

Offender shot convenience store clerk during an attempted robbery. *Robbery-Murder Suspect Arrested*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 18, 1998, at B3.

8. January 26; Richland County

Offender accosted players on a basketball court and attempted to rob them at gunpoint. When one of the players did not take the offender seriously, the offender shot him. *Shooting Victim Dies After Robbery Attempt*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 27, 1998, at B3; *Teen Arrested for Killing Man at Carver Elementary*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 28, 1998, at B3.

9, 10. February 6; Richland County

Offender, sitting in a car with two victims, shot and robbed them. Rick Brundrett, *Man Gets Life for Killing Ex-classmates*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 16, 2000, at B2; Rick Brundrett, *Trial Begins in 1998 Richland Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 12, 2000, at B6; Kimathi Lewis, *Cousin Held in Killings, Two Friends' Bodies Dumped on Road*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 13, 1998, at B1; Kimathi Lewis, *Few Details in Shooting of 2 Friends*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 10, 1998, at B3; Kimathi Lewis, *Two Bodies Found on Road, Reasons Unclear for Double Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 8, 1998, at B1.

11. February 23; Berkeley County

Popular 18-year-old high school student was shot four times when three offenders carjacked him. Victoria Agnew, *Fifth Suspect Faces Charges in Killing of CSU Student*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 12, 1998, at B5; Victoria Agnew, *Bail Denied Slaying Suspects*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 28, 1998, at B5; Victoria Agnew, *Four Face Charges in Keyes' Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 27, 1998, at A1; Victoria Agnew, *Man Charged in Athlete's Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 26, 1998, at A1; Victoria Agnew, *Carjacking Leaves CSU Player Dead*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 24, 1998, at B1; *CSU Slaying Trial Today*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 17, 1998, at B4; Richard Green, Jr., *Fourth Carjacking, Killing Suspect Gets 7 Years*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Oct. 19, 1999, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Man Gets Life Term for Keyes' Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 25, 1999, at A1; Richard Green, Jr., *Suspect's Defense Rests on Attorney*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 24, 1999, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Carjack-Murder Trial Set for Suspect in Keyes' Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 20, 1999, at B5; Richard Green, Jr., *Woman Pleads Guilty in Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 2, 1999, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Carjack Killer Gets Life*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 19, 1998, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *Witnesses Say McCall Talked of Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 18, 1998, at B1; Richard Green, Jr., *First Trial Slated in CSU Player's Carjacking Death*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 15, 1998, at B3; *Letters to Editor*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 17, 1999, at A10; Elsa McDowell, *Keyes Family Was Touched by an Angel*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 28, 1999, at B1; *Police Investigating Keyes Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 25, 1998, at B5;

Man Gets Life Sentence in Death of Athlete, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Feb. 26, 1999; *Williams Trial to Begin in Keyes' Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Jan. 9, 1999, at B4.

12. February 23; Horry County

Two offenders burglarized and robbed a business, then shot the security guard. Anita Brown, *Security Guard Shot Dead, Gaming Venue Scene of Slaying*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 24, 1998, at 1C; Lauren Leach, *Family, Friends Honor Graham; Ceremony Held Year After Death*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 24, 1999, at C1; *Man Slain 2 Years Ago Remembered*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Feb. 24, 2000, at C4; *Men Charged in Killing of a Security Guard*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 13, 1998, at B3; Tonya Root, *Two Men Indicted in Guard's Slaying*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Oct. 29, 1999, at C2; Tonya Root, *Bail Denied in Killing of Guard*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 9, 1999, at C3; Tonya Root, *Slaying Arrests Present for Dad, Son Shot in February While on Guard Duty*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 12, 1998, at C1.

13. March 7; Greenville County

Offender tried to break into a residence. Victim managed to close the door, but offender shot the victim through the door. *Greenville Man Charged with Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 25, 1998, at B3; *Greenville Man Shot, Killed During Break-in*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 9, 1998, at B2.

14. April 23; Horry County

Victim found shot in his car with his wallet missing. The wallet was found in the offender's possession when he was arrested. Helena Oliviero, *2 Loris Men Now Suspects in Slaying*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), June 6, 1998, at 1C; Tonya Root, *Six Residents Indicted on Murder Charges*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), July 10, 1999, at C2; Tonya Root, *Bail Denied in Killing of Guard*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 9, 1999, at C3; Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

15, 16. May 27; Orangeburg County

Four offenders were involved in this double homicide. One offender attempted to hire a hit man to kill the first victim; he declined. Then, the first offender hired another man to perform the hit, which he did, committing kidnapping and rape in the process. There were two other offenders marginally involved. Then, the first offender and the hit man killed the man who had declined to perform the hit. *Arrests Made in Orangeburg Investigation*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 30, 1998, at B3; *Bond Denied for 4 Accused in Killings*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 9, 1998, at B3; *Court Upholds Death Sentence*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, May 29, 2001; *4 Charged in Orangeburg Deaths Denied Bond*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 9, 1998, at B5; *Prosecutors to Seek Death for Two in Double Killing*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 18, 1998; *Slaying Leads Deputies to 2nd Body*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 30, 1998, at B6; *Woman Found Dead in Field Died of Gunshot Wounds*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 29, 1998, at B2; *Woman Gets Life in Prison for Role in Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Sept. 20, 1999, at 7A.

17. June 6; Orangeburg County

Three offenders shot victim several times in the head and legs during a carjacking. These offenders killed another victim earlier in 1998 while robbing a drug house.³⁷⁸ *Columbia Police Arrest Man Sought in Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 3, 1998, at B3; *Man Admits Role in Two Deadly Robberies*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 2, 2000, at B3; *Murder Suspect Arrested Near Main Street Restaurant*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 29, 1998, at B2.

18. June 21; Aiken County

*I followed up further in time than the others because the offenders were captured significantly after the murder, and the news articles continued longer.

Three offenders robbed a Sam's Club store by forcing the victim employee to open the safe, then the offenders closed the victim in a car's trunk and burned the vehicle. *Abduction Suspect Surrenders*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 30, 2001, at B3; John Allard, *Cayce Man Burned to Death in Car Trunk; Sam's Manager Believed Abducted at Augusta Store*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 23,

378. See *supra* Appendix Q at no.6.

1998, at A1; *Augusta Slaying Suspects Face More Charges*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 1, 2001, at B3; Blair Stokes Blanks, *Murder Trial Delays Charges in Holt Case*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 27, 2001, at B3; *Easterling Pleads Guilty in Two Killings Kidnapping*, AP, Mar. 7, 2001; Johnny Edwards, *Fourth Racketeering Arrest Made*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 3, 2001, at A1; Johnny Edwards, *Officials Link 3 to Suspects in Holt Death*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Mar. 30, 2001, at A1; *Ex-Con Jailed in '98 Sam's Club Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 23, 2001, at B5; Ashlee Griggs, *Defendant Gains Time in Death Penalty Trial*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), May 30, 2001, at C6; Ashley Griggs, *Attorney Outlines Slaying Cases Lawyer Focuses on Suspect in Holt, Store Owners' Killings*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Feb. 13, 2001, at A1; Lora Hines, *Grand Jury Indicts Three in Cayce Man's Kidnapping*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 24, 2001, at B1; Sandy Hodson, *Ex-Sam's Worker to Stay in Jail, Judge Denies Bond in Racketeering Case; Officials Allege Woman Gave Details to Suspects in Holt Case*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 28, 2001, at B1; Sandy Hodson, *Six Enter Not Guilty Please on Racketeering Charges*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 13, 2001, at A1; Sandy Hodson, *Rico Law Expert Explains its Terms*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Apr. 5, 2001, at B9; Sandy Hodson, *Holt, Walker Case Suspect Enters Deal*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Mar. 8, 2001, at A1; Sandy Hodson, *Men Plead Not Guilty in Robbery; Suspects in Sam's Club Manager's Slaying Answer Kidnapping Charges in Richmond County Superior Court*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Feb. 17, 2001, at C1; Sheryl Jean, *Investigation Narrows in Sam's Club Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 7, 1998, at A5; Clif LeBlanc, *Cayce Man's Killers Elude a Year of Probes and Pleas*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 20, 1999, at A1; *No Suspects in Death of Man Who Died in Trunk*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 24, 1998, at B3; *Plea Bargain*, AUGUSTA CHRON. (Ga.), Mar. 8, 2001, at A1; *Sam's Club Manager Burned Alive in Trunk*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), June 23, 1998, at B6; *Sheriff Mails Questionnaires in Holt Murder*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 24, 2000, at B5; *Wal-Mart Increases Reward for Information in Managers Death*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), June 20, 1999, at A1; *Suspects in Sam's Club Killing Face New Charges*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Apr. 4, 2001; *Third Suspect Surrenders in Sam's Club Manager Abduction*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Jan. 29, 2001; *Three Charged in Robbery, Kidnapping of Sam's Club Manager*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Jan. 23, 2001.

19. July 6; Charleston County

Offender shot victim, an acquaintance, while robbing him on the street. Edward C. Fennell, *Clues Sought in Shooting*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 8, 1998, at B1; Edward C. Fennell, *No Bail for Suspect on Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 15, 1998, at B1.

20. July 11; Charleston County

Offender kicked in door of victim's apartment and shot and robbed her. Offender also shot and robbed her boyfriend, who survived. Victoria Agnew, *North Charleston Woman Shot, Killed in Her Home*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 12, 1998, at A1; *Charleston Mother of 5 Dies After Shooting*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 13, 1998, at B3; Ellen B. Meacham, *Man Gets 30 Years in Woman's Murder*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Apr. 12, 2000, at B1.

21. July 23; York County

Four offenders attempted to carjack victim. When he resisted, one of them shot him in the head. *Brothers Sentenced in Shooting Death of Teen*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), July 21, 1999, at C5; Jeffrey Collins, *Suspects in Killing Appear in Court*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 30, 1998, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Police: Give Carjackers Anything They Want*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 27, 1998, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins & Andrew Skerit, *2 Suspects in Killing Had Records*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 25, 1998, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Carjacking, Robbery Attempt Turns Deadly in Rock Hill*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 24, 1998, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Mofatt Gets Sentence of 20 Years*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 21, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Killers Apologize to Unforgiving Dad*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 20, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Suspects Plead Guilty in Killing*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 17, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins, *Murder Suspects to Share One Trial*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 15, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Murder Case Pretrial Begins*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 13, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Killing Suspect Pleads Guilty*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 10, 1999, at 1A; Peter Krenn, *Voice of the People*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 3, 1999, at 9A; Melissa Manware, *3 Defendants in Murder Trial to Face Same Jury*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, July 15, 1999, at 1Y; *Rock Hill Teen Killed in Robbery Attempt*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 24, 1998, at B5; Michelle D. Snipe, *Fourth Teen Sentenced in*

Krenn Case, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, July 21, 1999, at 1Y; Michelle D. Snipe, *3 Plead Guilty in Teen-Ager's Slaying Case*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, July 17, 1999, at 1Y; Michelle D. Snipe, *Teens Await Ruling on Joint Trial, 3 Charged in Slaying Say Fairness is at Issue*, CHARLOTTE OBSERVER, July 13, 1999, at 1Y; *Teen Killed During Carjacking Attempt*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 25, 1998, at B3; *Teen-age Driver Fatally Shot During Carjacking Attempt*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), July 25, 1998, at B2; *Two Brothers Are Sentenced in Murder, Armed Robbery*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 21, 1999, at B12; *Two Brothers Sentenced in Shooting Death of Teen During Botched Carjacking*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, July 20, 1999.

22. August 1; Dillon County

Offenders, three acquaintances, robbed, kidnapped, and strangled victim. *Three Arrested in Slaying of Migrant Worker*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 5, 1998, at B2.

23. August 7; Bamberg County

Offender son burglarized his victim mother's house, stole her money and car keys, and hit her in the head two or three times with a hammer. *Man Charged with Killing His Mother with a Hammer*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 12, 1998, at B2.

24. August 22; Charleston County

Offender shot victim during an attempted robbery; a second person helped conceal the body. Victoria Agnew, *Leads Slim in Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 23, 1998, at B1; Edward C. Fennell, *Man Killed by Two, Police Claim*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 25, 1998, at B3; Brenna Reilly, *Two Men Charged in Slaying*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 24, 1998, at B1.

25. August 25; York County

Offender shot victim twice in a laundromat restroom while robbing him. Jeffrey Collins, *Defense Attempts to Discredit Witness Testimony About Shooting at Laundry*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 10, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Suspect Claims Self Defense*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 9, 1999, at 4A; Jeffrey Collins, *Trial For Man Accused in Bathroom Killing Starts Monday*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 6, 1999, at 1A; Jeffrey Collins,

Murder Suspect Denied Bond, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 29, 1998, at 1B; Kenneth A. Galliard, *Charlotte Man, Teen Arrested in Killing*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Aug. 27, 1998, at 4A; James R. Langford, *40-Year Prison Term Satisfies Victim's Mother*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 13, 1999, at 1B.

26. August 29; Cherokee County

Offender, wearing a mask, robbed a truck driver at a truck stop and shot him in the head. *Georgia Trucker Slain at Truck Stop*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 31, 1998, at B3; *Two Arrested in Death of Trucker*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 15, 1998, at B6.

27. September 28; Georgetown County

Offender robbed victim of a gold necklace on the street and shot him. *Georgetown Fugitive Arrested in New York*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Apr. 10, 1999, at C3; Yolanda Jones, *Georgetown Police Investigate Second Killing in Less Than a Week*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Sept. 30, 1998, at C1; Lauren Leach, *Police Still Search for Killing Suspect; Leads Also Sought in Death of Woman*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Dec. 4, 1998, at C4; Tonya Root, *Local & Regional*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 5, 1999, at C5; Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

28. October 21; Richland County

Offender carjacked victim, shot him, and dumped his body in a parking lot. Kimathi Lewis, *Man Found Shot to Death in Parking Lot*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 22, 1998, at B3; *N.C. Man Charged in Death of Man Found in Parking Lot*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Oct. 24, 1998, at B3; *N.C. Man Sentenced to 40 Years in Slaying*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 9, 2000, at B3.

29. November 15; Jasper County

Offender robbed and raped victim in her home, then, drowned her in her bathtub. *Hardeeville Murder Trial Continues Today*, BEAUFORT GAZETTE (S.C.), Nov. 29, 2000, at 1; *Jury: Orr Guilty of Murder*, BEAUFORT GAZETTE (S.C.), Nov. 30, 2000, at 1; *Letter to the Editor*, BEAUFORT GAZETTE (S.C.), Dec. 16, 2000; Jim Newman, *Jasper Deals with Horrific Homicide Year in Review*, BEAUFORT GAZETTE

(S.C.), Dec. 27, 2000; *Trial Begins in 1998 Hardeeville Slaying*, BEAUFORT GAZETTE (S.C.), Nov. 28, 2000, at 1.

30. November 21; Berkeley County

Offender, an acquaintance of 82-year-old victim, burglarized the victim's home, robbed, and shot him. Mark Hyler, *Suspect in Neighbor's Killing Denied Bail*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 26, 1998, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Murder Suspect Just Out of Prison*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 25, 1998, at B1; Mark Hyler, *Neighbor Charged in Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 24, 1998, at B1; Ellen B. Meacham, *Man Convicted for 1998 Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 25, 2000, at A1; Ellen B. Meacham, *Pineville Man, 31, Gets Life in 1998 Death of Neighbor*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 28, 2000, at D4; Brenna Reilly, *Man Found Slain*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Nov. 23, 1998, at B1.

APPENDIX S
INSUFFICIENT INFORMATION TO CATEGORIZE

1. January 7; Laurens County

Victim's body found shot several times beside his truck. No offender information was given. *Laurens Man Found Shot to Death at Hunting Lodge*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 10, 1998, at B2.

2. January 8; Richland County

Victim's body discovered stabbed twelve times about 100 yards from his home. No offender information was given. Kimathi Lewis, *Richland Man Fatally Stabbed*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Jan. 9, 1998, at B2.

3. Approximately January 29; Berkeley County

Victim disappeared on January 29, and her car was discovered burned and abandoned shortly thereafter. Her body was not discovered until five weeks later. She had apparently been kidnapped. Victoria Agnew, *One Year Later, Parents of Slain Teen Pray for Justice*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Feb. 7, 1999, at B1; *Charleston Investigators Seek Link Between Recent Rapes, 1998 Murder*, ASSOCIATED PRESS, July 10, 1999; *Detectives Identify Body as Missing 19-Year-Old Woman*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 10, 1998, at B2; Edward C. Fennell, *Capers Investigated for 1998 Killing*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), July 10, 1999, at B1; Edward C. Fennell, *Body Confirmed as Missing Woman*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Mar. 10, 1998, at A1; *Midlands Man Charged in Abduction*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 4, 1999, at 4B; *Police Investigate Recent Rapes, 1998 Murder*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), July 11, 1999, at 4B. Not reported in SLED Report.

4. March 13; Horry County

Victim died from a head injury in her living room. No offender information was given. Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998; Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

5. March 25; York County

Victim's body found in a field, dead from blunt instrument head trauma. No offender information was given. Melissa Manware, *Violent Crime Not Surprising to Officials*, THE HERALD (Rock Hill, S.C.), Mar. 27, 1998, at 1A; *York Deputies Hunting for Woman's Killer*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Mar. 27, 1998, at B2.

6. May 18; Sumter County

Three offenders killed victim at a park-and-ride lot. *Man Found Dead in Parking Area Was Beaten, Stabbed*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 22, 1998, at B2; *Sumter Man's Death Being Investigated as Homicide*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 20, 1998, at B3; *Two Charged as Accessories in Killing in Parking Lot*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), June 27, 1998, at B2.

7. May 23; Greenville County

Offender strangled victim. No further information was given. *Greenville Woman Dies After Struggle with Attacker*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), May 25, 1998, at B2; *Greenville Woman's Death Prompts Probe*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), May 25, 1998, at B3.

8. August 15; Lee County

Pregnant victim found badly beaten in a field. No offender information was given. Alan Blondin, *Lady Aucs Try to Keep Focus in Finals*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Mar. 13, 1999, at B1; *Body of Pregnant 16-Year-Old Girl Found in Lee County Field*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Aug. 18, 1998, at B2; Debbie Rhyne, *Players Death Unites Bishopville*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Mar. 10, 1999, at B3.

9. September 4; Aiken County

Victim's body found dead in woods from blunt force trauma to the head. There was no offender information. *Man's Body Found in Woods*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Sept. 6, 1998, at B2.

10. September 12; Horry County

Offender shot victim in a mobile home park. Tonya Root, *Police Stayed Busy in 1998, Domestic Violence Led to Homicides*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Jan. 1, 1999, at A1.

11. September 23; Georgetown County

Victim's body found beaten to death in an abandoned mobile home. No offender information was given. Scott Harper, *Puzzle Pieces of Woman's Death Don't Fit*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Sept. 29, 1998, at B1; Yolanda Jones, *Killings Alarm City Residents Warrants Issued in Fatal Shooting*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Oct. 3, 1998, at A1; Yolanda Jones, *Georgetown Police Investigate Second Killing in Less Than Week*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Sept. 30, 1998, at C1; Yolanda Jones & Lauren Leach, *Police Search for Lee Killer Georgetown Family Holding Up*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Sept. 26, 1998, at C1; Lauren Leach, *Leads Sought in Killing of Georgetown Woman Suspect Sought in 2nd Slaying*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Nov. 6, 1998, at C4; Lauren Leach, *Georgetown Police Seek Man, Leads in Killing*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Oct. 9, 1998, at C4; Lauren Leach & Yolanda Jones, *Children Discover Body of Woman, Georgetown Police Say They Suspect Foul Play*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Sept. 25, 1998, at C1; *Victim of Slaying to be Buried Today*, SUN NEWS (Myrtle Beach, S.C.), Sept. 29, 1998, at C3.

12. December 4; Greenville County

Victim died from multiple blows to the head. There was no offender information. *First Female Cadet's Grandfather Murdered*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 6, 1998, at B3.

13, 14. December 15; Jasper County

Victims, husband and wife, were shotgunned to death in their home. There were signs of forced entry. No offender information was given. *Jasper County Pair Killed*, THE STATE (Columbia, S.C.), Dec. 17, 1998, at B2; *Jasper County Pair Killed with Shotgun*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 17, 1998, at B3.

15. December 21; Dorchester County

Victim was strangled and her body left in the woods. No offender information was given. Mark Hyler, *Investigator Sure Someone Has*

Knowledge of Slaying, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Aug. 19, 1999, at B5; Mark Hyler, *Man May Have Been Last to See Slain Woman Alive*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 25, 1998, at B3; Mark Hyler, *Police ID Slain Woman*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 23, 1998, at B1; Mark Hyler *Woman's Body Found in Woods*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 22, 1998, at B1.

16. December 28; Florence County

Victim found shot to death in his car. There was no offender information. *Autopsy Shows Student Died of Gunshot*, POST & COURIER (Charleston, S.C.), Dec. 31, 1998, at B3.